



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 58224

**Title:** Simultaneous colorectal and parenchymal-sparing liver resection for advanced colorectal carcinoma with synchronous liver metastases: Between conventional and mini-invasive approaches

**Reviewer’s code:** 01804834

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author’s Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-07-12

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-08-10 09:55

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-08-13 14:13

**Review time:** 3 Days and 4 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The review article 'Simultaneous colorectal and parenchymal-sparing liver resection for advanced colorectal carcinoma with synchronous liver metastases. Between conventional and mini-invasive approaches' describes the latest studies in the field of CRC surgery and liver metastases and especially discusses the timepoint of resection for the primary cancer and its metastases. Firstly, the manuscript does not show any original data, since it is a review. The analysis of literature has been unstructured, not systematic or meta-analysis review. Secondly, the data of synchronous surgery has been interpreted by the authors as an outcome favouring procedure. Nevertheless, the cohort of patients who benefit should be more precisely described in terms of tumor burden and surgery procedures. Thirdly, the authors reviewed many well designed studies and described their results. Nevertheless, an overview table of studies and results would be very helpful and would underline the conclusion of the review.



### PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 58224

**Title:** Simultaneous colorectal and parenchymal-sparing liver resection for advanced colorectal carcinoma with synchronous liver metastases: Between conventional and mini-invasive approaches

**Reviewer's code:** 03664074

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-07-12

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-08-09 14:06

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-08-16 06:00

**Review time:** 6 Days and 15 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This manuscript has reviewed the optimal way of surgery in the light of colorectal cancer and liver metastases, including traditional simultaneous resections and mini-invasive techniques. It seems meaningful and credible in the colorectal cancer and liver metastases clinically. Maybe authors should focus the clinical status of colorectal cancer and liver metastases, the probable reasons between direct and indirect aspects of colorectal cancer and liver metastases, as well as demonstration of comparable methods among staged and synchronous resections and mini-invasive ways. Therefore, some chapters such as "THERAPEUTIC STRATEGIES FOR SYNCHRONOUS CRLM" and "PARENCHYMAL-SPARING LIVER RESECTION" can be condensed in quantities. In addition, reference numbers are too many to present. Authors should reduce the reference papers of the same citing place and keep the full cited reference numbers no more than 100 papers in this manuscript.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 58224

**Title:** Simultaneous colorectal and parenchymal-sparing liver resection for advanced colorectal carcinoma with synchronous liver metastases: Between conventional and mini-invasive approaches

**Reviewer's code:** 03546970

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-07-12

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-08-15 15:37

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-09-04 05:15

**Review time:** 19 Days and 13 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This manuscript has reviewed the latest studies about the optimal way of surgery for advanced colorectal carcinoma with synchronous liver metastases, including conventional and mini-invasive approaches, staged and synchronous resections. And the author also compared the differences between various treatments of resection. It seems meaningful in the colorectal cancer and liver metastases clinically. However, some content not related to surgical resection can be simplified, such as “THERAPEUTIC STRATEGIES FOR SYNCHRONOUS CRLM, Preoperative evaluation, Neoadjuvant chemotherapy for resectable CRLM, Clinical and prognostic relevance of genetic mutations of CRLMs”. In addition, there are too many references, it is best to reduce some references.