



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19078

Title: Laparoscopic and robot-assisted laparoscopic digestive surgery: Present and future directions

Reviewer's code: 03002261

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2015-05-07 09:34

Date reviewed: 2015-05-15 13:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To the authors In this paper, the authors has been well reviewed for laparoscopic surgery and robotic surgery in gastroenterological surgery. The reviewer considers that this report meet the criteria to be published in "World Journal of Gastroenterology".



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19078

Title: Laparoscopic and robot-assisted laparoscopic digestive surgery: Present and future directions

Reviewer's code: 02553737

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2015-05-07 09:34

Date reviewed: 2015-05-26 06:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The presented publication provides a thorough overview over laparoscopic and robot-assisted laparoscopic digestive surgery. The authors have to be congratulated on the extensive literature analysis performed. The authors state that their review is not meant to be a systematic review. However since the manuscript has a length of 26.000 words (with references; 15.000 words without) and a total of 323 publications I advise strongly to shorten and focus the manuscript. Due to its extent it is difficult to correct the manuscript as a whole. As the review was invited the inviting editor should clarify his expectations on the review. The review could be focused on one main topic as laparoscopic and robotic pancreatic surgery or could be published as a series according to this concept. An alternative could be laparoscopic vs. robotic surgery or open vs. laparoscopic surgery but not all three of these topics in one review. Also within the sections i.e. the sections "Robotic colorectal Surgery", "Robotic rectal resection for rectal cancer" and "Robotic versus laparoscopic surgery for rectal cancer comparative studies" should be combined or distinguished more clearly. Additional recommendations: References to the general questions and challenges raised in the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

introduction section should be given exemplarily. The use of tables should be considered to try to handle the vast amount of references.