

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 2188

**Title:** The Role of Salmonella Enterica in Crohn' s disease

**Reviewer code:** 00503628

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-02-06 09:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-02-12 03:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well done and controlled study, but lacks in novelty as this is a question that multiple other studies have already asked reaching similar conclusions. Maybe it is a confirmation of those studies in another well-defined population. Another comment relates to the title, the initial description of the infection and the ELISA used to establish prior exposure. While the title suggests the study is related to exposure to the Salmonella enterica serovar, the ELISA seems to be much broader in specificity as it indicates it detects Salmonella LPS.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 2188

**Title:** The Role of Salmonella Enterica in Crohn' s disease

**Reviewer code:** 00504869

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-02-06 09:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-02-22 08:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper represents a considerable amount of good work and merits publication, but only after the writing has been improved considerably (I have given the editor a pdf of the paper, with grammatical and spelling errors, as well as sentences with unclear meaning specified). I also have a couple of concerns with your methodology: 1) it seems to me that using *S. typhimurium* LPS in an ELISA assay to detect serum IgG molecules directed against *Salmonella enterica* could give a lot of false-negative results, given that *S. typhimurium* represents only one of ~2500 strains of *Salmonella enterica* (at the very least, you should include in your Methods section the Sigma catalog number for the LPS that was used in your study and perhaps a justification for why only one LPS was used; and 2) the manner of defining smokers and non-smokers seems problematic.....you define a smoker as someone who smokes at least 8 cigarettes a week, whereas a non-smoker, according to your definition, either does not smoke at all, or else, smokes less than 7 cigarettes a week (by this standard, it looks like person A who smokes 6 cigarettes a week would be placed into a separate category from person B, who smokes 8 cigarettes a week. Your data regarding the effects of smoking should be re-evaluated using a more rigorous distinction between smokers and nonsmokers.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 2188

**Title:** The Role of Salmonella Enterica in Crohn' s disease

**Reviewer code:** 00001558

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-02-06 09:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-03-07 14:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript aimed to study the association between exposure to Salmonella enteric and Crohn's disease. In addition, they also analyzed the involvement of cigarette smoking. They showed no association was found in Salmonella status and CD, but positive association in smoking and CD. However, the authors should perform following studies in order to address these issues and increase the impact of this manuscript. 1. This paper does not have a novelty because other reports have already similar conclusions. I think it may be valuable if the Chile people have any specific features on IBD or other related diseases If not, they should analyze more cases to firm the results. 2. Regarding the test for Salmonella IgG, their sensitivity and specificity should be described. 3. They showed positive relationship between SE IgG and smoking, this should be analyzed more in detail. There are numerous numbers of papers regarding CD and smoking. Numbers of IgG SE -positive patients were too small. 4. Title should be rephrased.