

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5949

Title: Exenatide improves hepatic steatosis by enhancing lipid use in adipose tissue

Reviewer code: 00038192

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 09:28

Date reviewed: 2013-09-30 16:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The abbreviation GLP-1 has to be explained before used the first time. Exenatide has to be shortly introduced. Superoxide dismutase, please specify which of the 3 proteins. Abstract: "were subdivided into two groups and injected with either exenatide or saline every day for 12 weeks. The control group received saline alone" are there 2 control groups? Results "Enhanced lipid oxidation results in the accumulation of intracellular reactive oxygen species (ROS), which induces the cellular response to eliminate this harmful by-product." Please give references

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5949

Title: Exenatide improves hepatic steatosis by enhancing lipid use in adipose tissue

Reviewer code: 02461842

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 09:28

Date reviewed: 2013-10-10 04:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting contribution to the literature. This reviewer has only few minor observations. 1) The authors should challenge the mice also with a high carbohydrates diet and see whether the effect on the GLP-1 is the same as for the high fat diet. 2) The authors should also measure the Short chain fatty acids (butyrate, acetoacetate and propionate) and check whether these might be related to GLP-1 expression. 3) there are several typos.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5949

Title: Exenatide improves hepatic steatosis by enhancing lipid use in adipose tissue

Reviewer code: 01800329

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 09:28

Date reviewed: 2013-10-11 02:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present interesting experimental data on the mechanism of action of Exenatide in hepatic steatosis. Some concerns come up on reviewing the paper which need to be addressed. 1. The details of assessment of histological changes in the animals are not given - e. g. quantification of the changes in the liver, and the details of areas chosen for analysis in the adipose tissue and the number of adipocytes assessed etc. These need to be provided. 2. How was the energy intake measured in the animals between Weeks 6 and 12 of the feeding protocol? Was the energy intake significantly different in the 3 groups? 3. What statistic was used to compare 2 groups e. g. as with Oxygen consumption and RER? 4. In the text and figures, the saline treated HFD group is referred to as HFD whereas the exenatide group is referred to as exenatide group while this group too was on HFD. Similarly rats on control diet are referred to as the 'control group', while the rats on HFD injected with saline also form a control group. This creates confusion - and is better corrected. 5. The authors hypothesized that exenatide effected its changes through altered lipid metabolic activities, including triglyceride hydrolysis and lipid oxidation. Could there be an alternative explanation - for e. g. restlessness or hyperactive behavior in the animals? 6. On treatment with exenatide the animals exhibited decreased food intake, weight loss, increased oxygen consumption, decreased respiratory exchange ratio, less liver fat and increased lipid oxidation by adipocyte? The authors do not tie up these findings to provide a satisfactory explanation for the effects of the drug in the discussion. This needs to be done. 7. HFD did not increase the weight in the saline treated group. And yet the animals on HFD developed hepatic steatosis. Exenatide prevented the steatosis. What is the significance of this model to human NAFLD? 8. Modifying the title to include 'non-diabetic rats' would put the whole paper in perspective.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5949

Title: Exenatide improves hepatic steatosis by enhancing lipid use in adipose tissue

Reviewer code: 00058403

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 09:28

Date reviewed: 2013-10-12 09:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper "Exenatide improves hepatic steatosis by enhancing lipid use in adipose tissue" is an experimental study with Male Wistar rats to evaluated effects of exenatide in hepatic steatosis of NAFLD. They were not put in abstract values and p-values found in the results, and the main aim is not according to the study. In the introduction, the last paragraph is confusing. The authors describe the hypothesis and results of this paper, without making clear the aim of the study. The results were also not identified the values corresponding to the analyzes made in the study (data not shown in figures).