

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16687

Title: Genomic Medicine in Gastroenterology: a new approach or a new specialty

Reviewer's code: 00069130

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 12:04

Date reviewed: 2015-02-04 22:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have gone through the M/S titled "Genomic Medicine in Gastroenterology: A new approach or a new specialty?" by Drs.Sonia and Arturo from Mexico. The authors express their thoughts and musings about genomic medicine-an evolving specialty and its place in modern medicine, which is losing its holistic approach partly because of its enormous progress which is in turn forcing it to divide it into sub-specialties. May be this 'divide and grow" mode of progress has taken its toll on human health from a holistic viewpoint and has tremendous public health impact. This is a manuscript which needs some language polishing. The authors need to add references to some of the data they have presented. I would recommend the publication of this manuscript in World journal of Gastroenterology.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16687

Title: Genomic Medicine in Gastroenterology: a new approach or a new specialty

Reviewer's code: 00069156

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 12:04

Date reviewed: 2015-02-12 18:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors attempted to provide a perspective on genomic medicine in the field of gastroenterology. While the topic indeed is quite interesting and has not been reviewed adequately in the published literature. It was disappointing to note that the content of the review did barely highlight this important issue. It would have been of great importance to the readers if the authors would discuss in more details the differences between single-gene and complex diseases, particularly as these relate to discovering disease-causing genes; the relation of genetic variation to disease phenotypes; study designs to dissect disease-causing genetic variants; the human haplotype map; and the ethical, legal, and social implications of human genomics in relation to gastroenterology. The figures are poorly presented and the figures legends do not stand alone and do not provide a clear explanation of the content.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16687

Title: Genomic Medicine in Gastroenterology: a new approach or a new specialty

Reviewer's code: 00069340

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 12:04

Date reviewed: 2015-01-29 10:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this editorial, the authors described issues and their comments regarding the evolving field in genomic medicine and its interactions with environmental factors, mainly focusing on gastroenterology and hepatology. The paper is well organised and presented. The proposals from the authors are of references for the medical educators and practitioners. In the figure legends of Figure 4 and 5, the abbreviations in the figures should also be noted.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16687

Title: Genomic Medicine in Gastroenterology: a new approach or a new specialty

Reviewer's code: 00070191

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 12:04

Date reviewed: 2015-02-11 15:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors described the role of genomic medicine by focusing on gastroenterology and liver diseases. 1. Although the data are well presented some of them need references. 2. Some abbreviations in the figures should be indicated in legends. 3. The paper needs some language polishing.