

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 25933

Title: Antibiotic-loaded phosphatidylcholine inhibits staphylococcal bone infection

Reviewer's code: 02691028

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 19:40

Date reviewed: 2016-04-19 10:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting paper.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 25933

Title: Antibiotic-loaded phosphatidylcholine inhibits staphylococcal bone infection

Reviewer's code: 02710967

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 19:40

Date reviewed: 2016-04-24 22:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a basic science study with a useful clinical application. Change manuscript type from basic study to basic science. The authors need to add a paragraph regarding the limitation of this study at the end of the discussion.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 25933

Title: Antibiotic-loaded phosphatidylcholine inhibits staphylococcal bone infection

Reviewer's code: 02691156

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 19:40

Date reviewed: 2016-04-27 16:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted manuscript, entitled "Antibiotic-loaded Phosphatidylcholine Inhibits Staphylococcal Bone Infection" is investigating whether antibiotic-loaded coatings could successfully prevent infection in a contaminated orthopaedic model? The Title: is referring directly to the problem at hand. Abstract: is sufficient and so is Introduction. Material and Methods: Animal model: The intramedullary placement of the implant, does not contribute to the stability of the osteotomised bone segment, and that probably is in favor of infection, although the time pass from the contamination is only one week. Statistical analysis: The number of animals, used in the study, is rather small for deduction of reliable statistical conclusions. Results: animals with uncoated implants were noted to have characteristics indicative of inflammation, compared to those with implants coated with vancomycin-loaded phosphatidylcholine. Discussion: is sufficient and the authors of present study emphasize that "this study demonstrates significant reduction in contamination and progression of disease, though some bacteria were recovered from the cortical bone and observed in the Gram stains". In conclusion: The authors conclude that "these easily-applied coatings can be used at the time of surgery to prevent orthopaedic infection and improve patient outcomes". Limitation of the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

study: a. the small number of the animals used in the study and b. the stability following reduction of the osteotomized bone segment. Figures: 4 figures are also included. References: 49 published papers are included in the study.