

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 49421

Title: Is there an association between Helicobacter pylori infection and irritable bowel syndrome? A meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02728252

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-05-30 07:56

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-30 10:58

Review time: 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Is the authors searched the Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews for the novelty of their systemic reviews and why there is no registration number from databases dealing with systematic reviews as PRSPERO. In addition, where is PICO statement, it should be



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

written clearly to be obvious in the manuscript?. Also, the research question should be included in the Methods section and finally what is the bias tool used in evaluating the selected studies.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ Yes
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ Yes
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 49421

Title: Is there an association between Helicobacter pylori infection and irritable bowel syndrome? A meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 00069819

Reviewer's country: Jordan

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-06-01 05:05

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-02 20:02

Review time: 1 Day and 14 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this meta-analysis the Authors aimed to study the putative association between H pylori infection and IBS. Overall, the manuscript is well written and sufficiently novel. The title is appropriate, although I wonder if it's a possible "disease association" or a



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

matter of cause effect relationship between H pylori and IBS! I have the following comments/suggestions for the Authors: 1. In the abstract, the methods and results should be expanded and detailed. 2. There is some concern that the small number of studies included in the meta-analysis and there remarkable heterogeneity may make it difficult to infer valid conclusions. 3. In the discussion section, the Authors should expand on the putative effect of H pylori eradication therapy of IBS symptoms.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 49421

Title: Is there an association between Helicobacter pylori infection and irritable bowel syndrome? A meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02861303

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-06-04 03:28

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-04 07:25

Review time: 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic of meta-analysis is quite relevant for two reasons. First, the extragastric manifestations of Helicobacter pylori infection are being actively investigated. Secondly, recently, the study of the microbiome in IBS patients and the probable association of



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Helicobacter pylori infection with gastrointestinal microbiomes has been rapidly progressing. Authors of the publication would be useful to briefly discuss these aspects of the problem. This can be done in the Discussion section. It also seems appropriate in the Introduction section to present a specific possible pathogenetic model of the association of Helicobacter pylori infection with irritable bowel syndrome. After these these minor improvements, the article can be published.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 49421

Title: Is there an association between Helicobacter pylori infection and irritable bowel syndrome? A meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 00006518

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-06-02 07:28

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-12 04:16

Review time: 9 Days and 20 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. In the literature, the association between H. pylori infection and functional dyspepsia (FD) had been widely investigated and discussed but no consistent information was achieved so far. Two studies included in this meta-analysis article [references 13 & 14]

evaluating patients with H. pylori infection in patients with dyspepsia with or without IBS which seems to have deviated from the theme of this manuscript. 2. Following the first question, the putative role of H. pylori infection in patients with ‘overlap syndrome with IBS and FD’ deserves further address in the manuscript. 3. There are many studies investigating gut microbiota and its association with IBS and loads of evidence indicates dysbiosis might be a hallmark of IBS, and H. pylori infection affect mainly the upper gastrointestinal (GI) tract instead of lower GI tract, the authors need to address their hypothesis in linking H. pylori infection and IBS robustly.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No