



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5399

Title: Iodine-131 - Labeled Metuximab Combined with Chemoembolization for Unresectable Hepatocellular Carcinoma versus the Chemoembolization

Reviewer code: 00253968

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 11:27

Date reviewed: 2013-09-18 00:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Q He et al investigated the safety and effectiveness of the combination of 131I-metuximab with transcatheter arterial chemoembolization (TACE) on Hepatocellular Carcinoma patients. 95 Patients who gave their informed consent to receive Licatin and TACE therapy served as test group, while others 90 patients served as control group and receive TACE only. They found that the combination of 131I-metuximab and TACE significantly prolonged survival in patients with HCC compared with TACE alone. Comments: 1.) Did the authors perform a prospective trial or is this a retrospective analysis? They do not provide specific data for the endpoints of their study? What was the statistical basis for number of patients included for example? 2.) The authors need to provide more details on their patients to exclude any imbalances. Basically absolute numbers for liver functions test including bilirubin, INR and platelets, AFP values, percent of vascular invasion, metastasis, size of tumor (size larger than 10cm). Moreover they should provide more precise data on time between TACE procedures, treatments during follow-up (RFA, ethanol injection and Sorafenib), reasons to stop TACE + 131I-metuximab and how many patients switched arms (and why). 3.) They also should provide data on liver function test at the end of TACE + 131I-metuximab. Did the more intense therapy affect the liver reserve? 4.) How do the authors explain that almost 50% of the patients in the TACE group died within 6 months. mOS in this group is very short and is nowadays seen in second line clinical trials of patients after Sorafenib failure.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5399

Title: Iodine-131 - Labeled Metuximab Combined with Chemoembolization for Unresectable Hepatocellular Carcinoma versus the Chemoembolization

Reviewer code: 00068912

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 11:27

Date reviewed: 2013-09-19 20:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor I read with interest the Manuscript He Q, Lu WS, Liu Y, Guan YS, Kuang AR. entitled: "Iodine-131-labeled Metuximab combined with chemoembolization for unresectable hepatocellular carcinoma versus the chemoembolization" The authors designed a study on one hundred and eighty-five patients (159 men and 26 women) with advanced HCC. The authors' data indicate that the combination of the 131I-metuximab with chemoembolization was safe and much more effective than TACE alone. The Title of manuscript accurately reflects the content of the article. Abstract contains a short description of the case. Abstract structured and include of the aim, methods, results and conclusion. The abstract and article are written in accordance with the Journal requirements. The Introduction gives sufficient information about the research objective. It is very important that author writes about his motivation to conduct this investigation. Patients and methods. The design of the study is simple and understandable. The description of the patients, their clinical category is cited in this part. Not clear this study prospective or retrospective? There is no description of how and on what devices were conducted diagnostic and control research. Methods of statistic processing of results have presented. Results. The description of the outcome, comparison of laboratory variables in the study groups is given in this part. Tables and figures are representative, reflect the results and content statistically reviewed materials. Poorly presented the results of the change of indicators in dynamics; why and how many patients were suspended treatment TACE + 131I-metuximab?