

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 43329

**Title:** Machine perfusion of the liver: Which is the best technique to mitigate ischaemia-reperfusion injury?

**Reviewer's code:** 00503371

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-05

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-05

**Review time:** 10 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                          | LANGUAGE QUALITY                                      | CONCLUSION                              | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS              |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | Peer-Review:                          |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language      | (High priority)                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous    |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good      | polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair      | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of     | (General priority)                      | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not    | language polishing                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:              |
| publish                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection           | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced     |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection      | <input type="checkbox"/> General      |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
|   |   |   | Conflicts-of-Interest:                |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes          |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No           |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very through and updated review, ready for publication.

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 43329

**Title:** Machine perfusion of the liver: Which is the best technique to mitigate ischaemia-reperfusion injury?

**Reviewer's code:** 03475636

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-21

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-21

**Review time:** 17 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION   | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language                 | (High priority)                                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of                | (General priority)                                 | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision            | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced             |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General   |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |  |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall, this is very excellent and well written papers. Excellent originality and writing styles. Comments: 1. Following recently published PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist Ann Intern Med. 2018, there are several items that



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

will help standardized this excellent Scoping Reviews - Introduction: Please summarize rationale/and add objectives of this review to help readers follow this review easier. - Before conclusion, if possible, please provide limitations of current evidence/scoping reviews and potential implications and/or next steps.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 43329

**Title:** Machine perfusion of the liver: Which is the best technique to mitigate ischaemia-reperfusion injury?

**Reviewer's code:** 03755443

**Reviewer's country:** Brazil

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-21

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-22

**Review time:** 1 Day

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION   | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language                 | (High priority)                                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of                | (General priority)                                 | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision            | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                 | <input type="checkbox"/> General              |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |  |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is good and well written. However, my opinion is that it is too long to be an EDITORIAL. I looks more like a MINIREVIEW.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 43329

**Title:** Machine perfusion of the liver: Which is the best technique to mitigate ischaemia-reperfusion injury?

**Reviewer's code:** 00505382

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-21

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-22

**Review time:** 1 Day

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION                                 | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept            | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language                 | (High priority)                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of                | (General priority)                         | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision    | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision    | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced             |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General   |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |  |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for this excellent paper

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 43329

**Title:** Machine perfusion of the liver: Which is the best technique to mitigate ischaemia-reperfusion injury?

**Reviewer's code:** 00057659

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-21

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-23

**Review time:** 2 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION                                    | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|---|--|---|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept               | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language                 | (High priority)                               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good            | polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept               | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of                | (General priority)                            | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not          | language polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision       | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish   | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced  |
|   |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General              |
|   |  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|   |  |   | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|   |  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|   |  |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic is interesting, however there is a lack of new informations or strategies to go.

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No