

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 89799

Title: National guidelines for the diagnosis and treatment of hilar cholangiocarcinoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05455405

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Russia

Author's Country/Territory: Pakistan

Manuscript submission date: 2023-11-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-11-30 03:52

Reviewer performed review: 2023-11-30 11:41

Review time: 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editors and authors! The data presented certainly reflect the main advances in the treatment and diagnosis of perihilar cholangiocarcinoma. Contains the conclusions of the national conciliation conference on this problem. No new data and scientific novelty for practice in the treatment of this type of cancer are provided. The NCCN system contains similar information and is superior to the proposed guidance in a number of ways. For example, to the approach to further patient management after radical and conditionally radical treatment (R1 and R0). No new concepts are reflected, for example, "Kovalenko YA, Zharikov YO, Konchina NA, Gurmikov BN, Marinova LA, Zhao AV. Perihilar cholangiocarcinoma: A different concept for radical resection. Surg Oncol. 2020 Jun;33:270-275 doi: 10.1016/j.suronc.2020.02.013. Epub 2020 Feb 17. PMID: 32561092." I recommend supplementing your guidelines for the treatment of perihilar cholangiocarcinoma with this document. The originality of the reviewed manuscript is 89.34%, which is quite high for the chosen type of scientific work, therefore, after finalizing the text, it can be accepted for consideration for possible publication in a journal.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 89799

Title: National guidelines for the diagnosis and treatment of hilar cholangiocarcinoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05117581

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: N/A

Professional title: N/A

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Pakistan

Manuscript submission date: 2023-11-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-02 10:45

Reviewer performed review: 2023-12-02 11:39

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article mainly introduces the treatment guidelines for hilar cholangiocarcinoma in Pakistan. Hilar cholangiocarcinoma is difficult to treat worldwide due to its unique tumor location, poor prognosis, and lack of treatment options. Due to different factors in each country and region, the diagnosis and treatment plans for bile duct cancer also vary. So I believe it is necessary to develop a diagnosis and treatment plan for one's own country and region. But I think there are several shortcomings in this article: 1. This article mainly aims to develop a diagnosis and treatment plan for hilar cholangiocarcinoma in your own country, but the arguments in the article mainly rely on foreign literature and lack epidemiological data from our own country. If there is domestic epidemiological data, it would be more relevant. 2. This article provides a detailed introduction to the diagnosis and surgical treatment of hilar cholangiocarcinoma, but there is relatively little introduction to palliative treatment. Currently, targeted immunotherapy for cholangiocarcinoma is flourishing, and I think a more detailed introduction can be provided.