

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11438

Title: Clinicopathologic Factors and Molecular Markers related to Lymph Node Metastasis in Early Gastric Cancer

Reviewer code: 02346872

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-22 08:34

Date reviewed: 2014-05-25 20:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Summary: This study analyzed 1,104 patients with early gastric cancer who underwent a gastrectomy with lymph-node dissection. The goal was to assess predictive factors for lymph node metastasis in early gastric cancer. The authors proposed that female gender, tumor size, and lymphovascular invasion were predictive risk factors for lymph node metastasis in EGC. Abstract: OK. Introduction Line 5, Page 8, " prognosis in in", the word 'in' may be redundant. Materials and Methods Patients Page 8, second paragraph, the performed institute should be blinded in the manuscript. Results: OK. Discussion: Could this information be used to modify the management of the subjects to further improve the outcomes? References: OK. Tables: OK. Overall: This is a general look at a specific tumor work up. The data suggest that EGFR overexpression is likely to be one of the potential risk factors for lymph node metastasis in EGC. This information may be value in helping the management of these subjects.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11438

Title: Clinicopathologic Factors and Molecular Markers related to Lymph Node Metastasis in Early Gastric Cancer

Reviewer code: 00724342

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-22 08:34

Date reviewed: 2014-06-04 05:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is good. It will be of interest to the readership. It would be better if it is organized as a prospective study

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11438

Title: Clinicopathologic Factors and Molecular Markers related to Lymph Node Metastasis in Early Gastric Cancer

Reviewer code: 00054174

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-22 08:34

Date reviewed: 2014-06-04 12:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

offer the typical immunohistochemistry photograph

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11438

Title: Clinicopathologic Factors and Molecular Markers related to Lymph Node Metastasis in Early Gastric Cancer

Reviewer code: 00054133

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-22 08:34

Date reviewed: 2014-06-05 21:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present study tried to identify predictive markers of lymph node metastasis (LNM) in patients with early gastric cancer (EGC) by analyzing clinicopathologic and molecular markers of 1,104 patients who underwent gastrectomy for EGC. The authors showed that female gender, positive lymphovascular invasion, large diameter (>20mm), and positive EGFR expression on immunohistochemical section were independent risk factors of LNM. 1) Indication criteria of ESD/EMR in the authors's institute should be shown. 2) Of 1,104 patients studied, 625 patients (57%) were mucosal cancer. Of these, how many patients had elevated small (<20mm) differentiated cancer without ulceration? 3) As the authors mentioned in Introduction part, elevated small (<20 mm) differentiated mucosal cancer without ulceration is a generally accepted criteria for EMR/ESD for EGC. This criteria has been determined based on the data of numerous EGC patients. The incidence of lymph node metastasis should be shown according to this generally accepted criteria. 4) Then the authors should propose a new criteria including gender, lymphovascular invasion, and EGFR as factors based on the sensitivity, specificity and accuracy. 5) Because the present study analyzed only surgical patients, the patient population that was indication for EMR/ESD was excluded. This selection bias of the patients should be mentioned in Discussion part as limitation of the study.