

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25806

**Title:** Radiotherapy as a valid alternative local modality for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombosis

**Reviewer's code:** 00068723

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-23 15:13

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-08 13:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

PVTT is a major problem in the management of HCC. It is expected that radiation therapy would increase the poor survival of patients with PVTT. This review covered conventional RT to particle. The topic was relevant. Figure 2 was suitable to understand the determination of the irradiation field. It seemed that "RT" was used for photon, such as 10MeV X-ray and gamma ray. It would help to avoid confusion if introduction of radiation therapy was added just before "Application of RT in HCC". In the new section, RT with photon and particle would be described briefly. Not many readers are familiar with RT, especially particle. Are there any reports on carbon ion to PVTT? Liver function is another factor for patient survival. Based on the literatures, how did the authors think about liver function? RT may cause liver damage that resembles veno-occlusive disease. Are there any literatures on radiation liver damage? The liver damage is one of the limiting factors of RT to HCC. What happens in patients with PVTT treated with RT in this regard? Referenece list was absent. It was impossible to refer literatures cited in this manuscript. For example, reference 67, 71, 106, and 107 regarded RT to PVTT.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25806

**Title:** Radiotherapy as a valid alternative local modality for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombosis

**Reviewer's code:** 02860797

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-23 15:13

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-19 05:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed recent progress in radiotherapy for liver cancer treatment. This topic is important since radiotherapy is much less used in Asian countries compared to western countries. HCC with PVTT is tricky and RT, as they show, can improve certain patients. The review has covered most relevant filed except the limitations of RT, which should be included. The structure of the review can be improved. Some sentences lack references.