ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7070

Title: Allele and haplotype frequencies for HLA DQ in Iranian celiac disease patients

Reviewer code: 01555264

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-04 19:43

Date reviewed: 2013-11-04 20:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[Y] High priority for
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

priority publishing

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7070
Title: Allele and haplotype frequencies for HLA DQ in Iranian celiac disease patients
Reviewer code: 00188820
Science editor: Qi, Yuan
Date sent for review: 2013-11-04 19:43
Date reviewed: 2013-11-19 06:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper entitled "The frequency of HLA DQ haplotypes in Iranian celiac disease patients" by Rostami-Nejad et al. discussed the distribution of HLA-DQ2 and -DQ8 in celiac patients. The authors aimed to identify the prevalence of these allels in celiac and healthy population and to compare that with previously described tagging SNP methods and commercial kits already available. The reviewed article is a description of a niche study. Indeed, there are no data available about the HLA distribution of celiac patients in Iran. Furthermore, the current work is also authorized a novel SNP method to assess HLA distribution. The main importance of HLA mapping is to combine the less-invasive methods into a diagnostic algorithm to substitute the gold-standard of biopsy sampling. Carrying HLA risk allels can be a predictor of susceptibility to celiac disease. Three questions are suggested by the work of the authors. - The tagging method of SNP analysis showed less sensitivity and specificity. Instead of this method, which one is recommended for screening also in Iranian population? - The authors discussed the interesting point of correlation of HLA risk allels and Marsh classification, however the method of statistical analysis (correlation) was not described in statistical section. - As a result of HLA mapping, is there a method or combination on non- or less-invasive methods to bypass the endoscopy and biopsy sampling in the diagnose of celiac disease? In conclusion, the current article is a great summary of a pilot study conducted in Iranian celiac patients. It is well written, and also the tables ant figures are of outstanding quality. It is recommended to accept these articel after a minor revision, as the data reported in the work of the authors filled a gap in the knowledge of genetic predisposing factors in celiac population.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7070

Title: Allele and haplotype frequencies for HLA DQ in Iranian celiac disease patients

Reviewer code: 02548945

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-04 19:43

Date reviewed: 2013-11-19 16:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the current study Nejad et al., has described the frequency of HLA alleles in Celiac Disease patients from Persian Gulf region. Although, HLA allele frequency distribution has been assessed in Iranian population as a risk marker for type 1 diabetes mellitus, common variable immune deficiency, periodontitis, multiple sclerosis, information on celiac disease patients is lacking. Although, the information on HLA allele distribution in Iranian Celiac disease patients is important given their critical role in predisposing the individuals to gluten insensitivity, but small number of patients limits the statistical conclusions that can be derived from this study. HLA –tagging SNPs based approach that is adopted in this study is a best described method for determination of HLA alleles.