

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9122

Title: Usefulness of myocardial positron emission tomography in Takotsubo cardiomyopathy.

Reviewer code: 00225343

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-23 21:40

Date reviewed: 2014-01-24 02:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a good work

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9122

Title: Usefulness of myocardial positron emission tomography in Takotsubo cardiomyopathy.

Reviewer code: 00238092

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-23 21:40

Date reviewed: 2014-01-24 14:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review article, Marzia et al. briefly summarized recent findings on the radiological imaging of Takotsubo cardiomyopathy (TTC) and discussed their usefulness in the clinical practice. The manuscript is generally well prepared, but this reviewer has several minor concerns for the authors to consider:

1. The authors could assign page and line numbers in the manuscript for an easier reviewing process. This reviewer designated the title page as the first page and the last one as page 9 in the following description.
2. Regarding the abbreviation of LV: On page 2 and 3, the authors abbreviated "left ventricular" as "LV". However, on line 6 on page 3, LV would represent "left ventricle" rather than "left ventricular". Then, on the last line on page 5 and on line 7 and 21 on page 6, "left ventricular" was spelled out without clear rationale. Please reorganize them for consistency.
3. Regarding "ACS": The term "acute coronary syndrome" appeared in the abstract as well as on page 3 without abbreviating, and "ACS" was introduced and used twice on page 6. If it is to be abbreviated, it should be done at its first appearance.
4. On line 7 on page 6, the abbreviation "TTC" should be used, unless there is a specific reason to spell out.
5. On line 1 on page 5, "ipo/akinesia" may mean "hypo/akinesia". Please correct.
6. On line 21 on page 5, "a severe/absence mIBG uptake" should be rephrased. It could be "a severe reduction/absence of mIBG uptake", for example. On the next line, "was observed" is redundant and should be deleted.
7. In the 3rd paragraph of page 6, citation numbers (2, 6, 7) appeared in a different format. Please edit and examine whether the numbers are correct.
8. There are extra spaces between words everywhere in the text: more than 20 locations including the title. They could be easily identified by applications such as MS Word. Please edit carefully.
9. Reference #4 appeared in a different format than the others. Also in reference #10,

the pages could appear “2598-604” to be consistent. The ending period is missing in the references #10, #12, and #13. 10. Regarding the Table 1, “-” could be explained in the legend, such as “not examined”. The numbers “39” and “20” outside the chart may reflect the total in the column, but are they necessary? If so, the authors need to provide another row for the total numbers. 11. In the Table 1, the format of the number of subjects should be standardized. For instance, the authors may unify to the style in the follow-up. Accordingly, in the fifth column of “MRI”, the data should read “n=3”. Revise similarly the columns “FDG-PET” (delete “(n)” here) and “MIBG”. Then, add in the legend, “n: number of subjects”, for example.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9122

Title: Usefulness of myocardial positron emission tomography in Takotsubo cardiomyopathy.

Reviewer code: 00060496

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-23 21:40

Date reviewed: 2014-01-24 20:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report an interesting review on PET in tako tsubo cardiomyopathy. Despite the work strengths, we recommend addressing the following comments: 1. add other tables detailing the features of the included studies; 2. provide some illustrative examples of PET in this condition; 3. add a figure detailing the diagnostic and work-up flow-chart to use appropriately and timing PET in patients with suspected or confirmed tako tsubo.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9122

Title: Usefulness of myocardial positron emission tomography in Takotsubo cardiomyopathy.

Reviewer code: 00069439

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-23 21:40

Date reviewed: 2014-01-29 02:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this article the authors aimed to summarize the results of four articles on the use of myocardial positron emission tomography (PET) in Takotsubo cardiomyopathy. 1. This paper does not seem appropriate for this Journal; the manuscript presented is certainly dealing with a very rare cardiological entity, however, the article is neither a meta-analysis or a review manuscript. The authors describe the results of 4 major manuscripts and include in their description the role of different nuclear medicine techniques, including myocardial scintigraphy and 123I-mIBG SPECT, in addition to FDG-PET scan (in the title the authors only mention PET scan technique). 2. In the discussion the authors state that "PET imaging, using the quantitative analysis, confirmed the light impairment of MBF in dysfunctioning left ventricular segments in the acute phase together with a clearly reduction of CFR after vasodilator stimuli. These MBF modifications recovered completely in the follow-up, probably justified the favourable clinical prognosis in those patients". These conclusions need to be confirmed in larger patient populations and larger studies. 3. It would be also interesting to show comparative data with MRI, that is certainly a major diagnostic technique to be used in this rare cardiac dysfunctional abnormality. Figures: no figures are presented by the authors.