



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6531

Title: α -SMA expression in LDLT recipients with cessation of immunosuppression; two case report.

Reviewer code: 00039518

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-24 08:36

Date reviewed: 2013-12-04 03:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper " α -SMA expression in LDLT recipients with cessation of immunosuppression: two case report" is interesting and deserves consideration for publication in World Journal of Gastroenterology. I have some concerns that should be addressed by the Authors. The Authors should specify in Materials and Methods which was the etiology of liver disease in the 2 pediatric patients who had immunosuppression withdrawal. I suppose it was biliary atresia according to the abbreviation BA reported in Table 1. Furthermore, the reason why the immunosuppressant medication was withdrawn in these 2 cases should be explained. According to figures 2 and 3, the increased number of α -SMA positive cells in 2 transplanted pediatric patients without immunosuppression compared to 4 pediatric patients transplanted and immunosuppressed does not seem to translate into a significantly worse course of fibrosis progression as the 2 immunotolerant patients show staging 0 and 1 at 7 and 9 years from transplant, respectively. This counteracts the statement " α -SMA appears to be a potential marker predicting the progression of fibrosis" (Discussion section). The Authors should comment and discuss this point. Minor points The abbreviation α -SMA must be substituted with the extended expression "smooth muscle actin" in the title and in the abstract at first citation. Abstract, line 2: change immunosuppressant with immunosuppression; line 5: change ...two patients...with ...two pediatric patients; line 8: change ...to the cases...with...to four transplanted pediatric patients....; line 9: change ...in these adult cases...with ...in three adult transplant patients....; line 11: change ...may...with...could... Introduction, page 4, line 16: change...such as infection... withsuch as in the case of infection... Introduction, page 4, line 24: change ...induced by immunosuppression... with ...induced by withdrawal of immunosuppression.... Discussion, page 10, line 15: change ...imagined that...



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

withsupposed that.... Discussion, pages 10-11: I do not understand well the meaning of the phrase...an increase in α -SMA might have been observed in patients who did not have an increase in α -SMA at the prefibrotic stage if the time of the biopsy had been different. Please clarify. Discussion, page 11, line 18: change ...reports in mice that T cells... with... reports in mice showing that T cells... Discussion, page 12, lines 3-4: change the phrase "Therefore, we currently confirm the presence of fibrosis by liver biopsy to decide on the course of treatment" as follows: Therefore, we confirm that the liver fibrosis staging assessed by biopsy is the main parameter influencing the course of treatment



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6531

Title: α -SMA expression in LDLT recipients with cessation of immunosuppression; two case report.

Reviewer code: 00502871

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-24 08:36

Date reviewed: 2013-12-12 00:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript identifies two patients who had increased alpha-smooth muscle actin expression in hepatic stellate cells in grafted livers when immune suppression was discontinued. This may be an important mechanism for late graft failure due to fibrosis. The methodology is well described and appears to be appropriate. The number of index patients is small (N of 2) limiting the robustness of the conclusions. Collaboration with other centers for confirmation with a larger sample may be possible.