



**ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10968

**Title:** Current Surgical Treatment Strategies for Hepatocellular Carcinoma in North America

**Reviewer code:** 00054593

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-29 17:55

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-30 14:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

It is a comprehensive review on an important topic. There are few questions and comments for the authors to consider. 1. In abstract, the last sentence "These loco-regional modalities can also be used ...." is not really related to the review topic. Can consider to revise or delete it. 2. In Diagnosis section, "PET scan has limited role in HCC staging...". It is not correct in the setting of new Dual tracers PET (FDG and C-acetate PET). Please kindly revise and add the reference accordingly. 3. In my opinion, the discussion point is whether hepatic resection is justified whether or not be it a laparoscopic or open, it has no consensus. No need to discuss them separately. 4. Please delete or revise "History" session, which is not relevant to the topic. 5. Recently, there is a pilot study on HIFU as a bridging therapy and the authors may worth mention it. 6. Table 1 for Child-Pugh Classification is probably deletable.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10968

**Title:** Current Surgical Treatment Strategies for Hepatocellular Carcinoma in North America

**Reviewer code:** 02539179

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-29 17:55

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-12 22:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript introduced current surgical treatment strategies for hepatocellular carcinoma. The article is well written and post significance on clinical guidance. The title indicated that the introduced surgical treatment strategies for Hepatocellular Carcinoma might be subject to North America location. However, there is no introduction on what is the difference between the strategies of north and south america, or other countries. The updated guidelines from AASLD, ESAL and APASL on HCC treatment were not referred and compared.