



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 85920

Title: Left epigastric isolated tumor feeding with inferior phrenic artery was diagnosed with ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma: a case report.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer’s code: 02540325

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Full Professor

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: Nepal

Author’s Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-07-12 03:09

Reviewer performed review: 2023-07-12 04:00

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Rare disease with excellent treatment outcome. Congratulations for picking good case for case report. However, need to revise it before publication. Some corrective points are given in word file itself. The most important point is that when you say pedunculated HCC, you should mention about stalk. May or may not be present, but it should be described.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 85920

Title: Left epigastric isolated tumor feeding with inferior phrenic artery was diagnosed with ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma: a case report.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02445477

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, MS

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-07-13 14:51

Reviewer performed review: 2023-07-13 15:04

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Needs Professional English editing to simplify language. Abstract too long. We thoroughly described the patient's case information, course of treatment, and the excellent curative outcome in Abstract is erratic. Core tip needs to relook. What is ascites within normal limits. What is "The patient's left upper abdominal mass had a clear diagnosis " Did CT diud not detected this advanced tomour ? What was significance of tomour being supplied by the left IPA.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 85920

Title: Left epigastric isolated tumor feeding with inferior phrenic artery was diagnosed with ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma: a case report.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer’s code: 03742333

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Full Professor, Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: Brazil

Author’s Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-07-11 11:00

Reviewer performed review: 2023-07-14 17:13

Review time: 3 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have read with great interest the manuscript entitled “Left epigastric isolated tumor fed by the inferior phrenic artery diagnosed as primary hepatocellular carcinoma: a case report”, submitted to the World Journal of Clinical Cases. The Case Report describes an unusual hepatocellular carcinoma presentation. Due to the exceptionality of the case, I have a few comments. **MAJOR COMMENTS** - According to the description, the HCC was considered a pedunculated lesion outside of the liver. Pedunculated HCCs are very rare. Their occurrence in a setting of a non-cirrhotic liver with no viral hepatitis or steatosis is even rarer. Therefore, this diagnosis must be extremely well established. In accordance with these comments, I would suggest that authors perform and report the assessment of at least two expert pathologists on liver diseases. In addition, the literature must be revised to the occurrence of similar cases and not on pedunculated HCC. - Once the tumour was excised entirely during the surgery, why hepatic arterial interventional chemotherapy was performed? This method is not routinely employed in Western countries. Could the authors clarify the rationale behind using the treatment for this case in the manuscript?



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com