



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8505

Title: Partial ACL tears treated with intraligamentary PRGF

Reviewer code: 00646703

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-30 09:42

Date reviewed: 2013-12-31 13:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors aimed to evaluate the effect of the application of PRGF-Endoret to the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL tears. Unfortunately there is no control group to test any effectiveness of the application of PRGF-Endoret to the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL tears. Without a control group, there is no evidence to prove that the good return rate to the same pre-injury level of sport activity was contributed by the application of PRGF-Endoret to the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL tears. It is also possible that these patients would have a good return rate to the same pre-injury level of sport activity without the application of PRGF-Endoret to the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL tears. A retrospective review of the rate of return to play in football players treated with the application of PRGF-Endoret in the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL injuries that underwent surgery for knee instability may have some valuable information, but not enough to claim the effectiveness of the application of PRGF-Endoret to the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL tears. No valid conclusion could be reached regarding the effectiveness of the application of PRGF-Endoret to the remaining intact bundle in partial ACL tears.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8505

Title: Partial ACL tears treated with intraligamentary PRGF

Reviewer code: 00504783

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-30 09:42

Date reviewed: 2014-01-06 22:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8505 When the clinical application of growth factors was considered, platelet-rich plasma (PRP), is a rich source of autologous growth factors, as demonstrated by platelet derived growth factor (PDGF), transforming growth factor- β (TGF- β), basic fibroblast growth factor (bFGF), insulin growth factor (IGF), vascular endothelial growth factor (VEGF), and epithelial cell growth factor (ECGF) in its natural composition. The injectable PRP has recently shown an increasing development to provide suitable strategies for the regeneration of damaged ligament, such as Anterior Cruciate Ligament (ACL) tears that is the most commonly injured of the major knee ligaments. However, the academic debate on this topic is still remained, with the presence mainly of low quality studies. Many aspects still have to be understood, such as the biomaterials that can benefit most from PRP and the best protocol for PRP both for production and application. In this review, partial ACL tears were treated with intraligamentary plasma rich in growth factors (PRGF) and results showed positive therapeutic effects. The weaknesses of this review arise from the lack of 1) the control groups, 2) detailed information of growth factors in the PRGF-Endoret, and 3) functional assessments after treatment, but the review goals are clearly described. The review fits well within the scopes of WJO. The current version of the paper does not require a further revision. A minor comment: 1) Title: PRGF may be replaced by PRP, a common name of platelet-rich plasma including growth factors. If authors still plan to use PRGF in the title, they have to describe the detailed information of growth factors. 2) Keywords: a little confusion. Authors may only keep: ACL, partial tears, PRP.