

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 00360076

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-23 00:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described mucosal dysregulation in IBD with a major focus on cytokines. The following points should be addressed: - The selection of the cytokines that were covered in this review is unclear. - Key cytokines such as IFN-gamma, IL-6 and TNF are more or less not covered and this is essential for this review. - The signature transcription factors of Th subsets are mentioned but they are not discussed in the context of IBD and IBD mouse models. There are data on the expression of T-bet and RORA/C in IBD patients and in murine models of IBD. This needs to be discussed. - The effects of cytokines on barrier function is not very well described. - The regulation of T cell death in relation to cytokines should be discussed.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 00503405

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-26 01:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the review article of Xu X. et al. (Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases) the authors aimed to summarize the latest development in the field of mucosal immunity regarding IBD. Though the topic is interesting and actual, there are points that need to be revised. The title is misleading. Although the title promises a review about the new aspects of innate and adaptive immunity in IBD, the authors focused mainly on CD4+ T cell related immune responses, some new cytokines, and Th17 cells. The role and functional alterations of the innate immunity, the role of regulatory B cells are not discussed. The title must be changed or the text must be extended by the discussion of the above mentioned immunological processes. The imbalance of cytokine profiles is interpreted as a proinflammatory factor in IBD. This is only true in part. The cytokine profile imbalance may lead to inflammation and a parallel tissue regeneration as well. The role of the innate immunity is also crucial in this switch point. This must be discussed. In page 4. line 28-32: the authors list macrophages, DCs, mast cells, neutrophils, eosinophils and fibroblasts as lymphocytes. It is not correct. They are mononuclear cells of the mucosa, all leukocytes, except fibroblasts. English language needs an extensive review as well. After major revision I suggest to accept the manuscript in WJG for publication.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 00055041

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-26 18:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper. The results are clear and well described. In the Discussion, the Authors should highlight the possible clinical significance of their findings

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 00069751

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-10-04 18:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors are presenting a very well written and comprehensive review on one of the key issues in pathogenesis research in IBD, i.e. the dysregulation of the mucosal immune response.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 02529650

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-10-07 18:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors have presented an interesting overview on the role of immune response in the pathogenesis of IBD. They have first provided a general description of cells and molecules involved in immune response during intestinal inflammation, and then have explained in details how the different families of IL contribute to this process, sometime referring to their own results. The title of the manuscript adequately reflect the major topic of the work. Abstract is general enough in contents but sufficient to present and introduce the major topic of the manuscript. Manuscript is well structured, and figures included in this work to present part of the data described in the manuscript are appropriate. Minor comments: Authors should better explain the clinical implication and significance of the presented data, including the findings of their own studies. Page 4, line 3: "...the sustained the intestinal infections...", the second "the" should be removed. Page 8, lines 11-15: This sentence is too long, so the authors have to rewrite it to make it more fluent. Page 9, lines 17-20: These data should be better introduced and explained in this section. Page 10, line 18: Change "...and expresses..." with "...expressed..." Page 10, line 2: "Moreover" and "...also..." should be removed. Page 11, line 2-3: Correct "...fail..." and "...develop..." with "...fails..." and "...develops..." Page 11, line 6: Find a synonym for "while" to begin this sentence. IL-23 and IL-35 section should be moved on, after IL-25 section. Furthermore, as they did for IL-27, authors have to explained the potential pathogenic/protective role of IL-35. Page 15: Data on miR10 data are not yet published? Authors must indicate this better, rather than write "data not shown". In miR section authors have to add references in the first part and at page 15 if results presented at page 14-15 do not refer to Ref. No.46 -47. Also the work of Cosken et al, W J Gastro 2013 19(27): 4289-99



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

should be cited. Please pay attention to Ref. No.47, since PMID reported in the manuscript did not correspond to the cited article. Punctuation throughout the entire manuscript could be improved.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 02531403

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-10-17 22:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors In this work is described the mechanisms of disregulations of the immune response in the pathogenesis of IBD The manuscript is complexively well written. The abstract reflects the key messages of the paper. Major points: - The role and functional alterations of the innate immunity, together with the role of regulatory B cells are not discussed and these topics are worthy of discussion, as well as cytokines such as IFN-gamma, IL-6 and TNF, and their role on barrier function are not fully covered throughout the discussion, Minor points: - Punctuation throughout the entire manuscript should be improved

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5694

Title: Dysregulation of mucosal immune response in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel diseases

Reviewer code: 00036023

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 19:21

Date reviewed: 2013-11-28 01:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper summarises the many diverse dysregulation of the mucosal immune system. The addition of a short discussion of innate immunity is helpful. There is no discussion of autophagy and its role in immune dysregulation. While the paper has merit it is somewhat dense and difficult for the non-immunologist and general reader. In figure 2 there is a pair of scales with Th1/17 and Th2 Treg and appears that Th2/Treg is heavier (I suspect the authors meant the opposite).