

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10489

**Title:** Anti-hepatofibrotic properties of CGX on chronic alcohol consumptions in rat model.

**Reviewer code:** 00068153

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-02 21:42

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-08 09:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors investigated the anti-hepatofibrotic properties of Chunggan extract (CGX) and its possible mechanisms of action in a rat model. The results showed that CGX has anti-hepatofibrotic properties via modulation of fibrogenic cytokines and alcohol metabolism. It is very useful for clinicians to know the detailed mechanism of CGX in the treatment of alcohol consumption-derived hepatofibrosis. However, there are still some points need to be improved: 1. It could be better if the in vitro experiment was arranged before the in vivo experiment. 2. Usually, A P value less than .05 was considered significant. Why the authors used  $P < 0.05$ ,  $P < 0.01$ , and  $P < 0.001$  to indicate statistical significance, respectively? 3. The English need to be polished.



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10489

**Title:** Anti-hepatofibrotic properties of CGX on chronic alcohol consumptions in rat model.

**Reviewer code:** 00058401

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-02 21:42

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-11 02:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors Congatulations for the quality of your5 work -liberatocaboclo.



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10489

**Title:** Anti-hepatofibrotic properties of CGX on chronic alcohol consumptions in rat model.

**Reviewer code:** 00058696

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-02 21:42

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-13 23:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

We have examined carefully this new manuscript. Dr. Kim et al have presented their results on the beneficial effects of Chunggan extract (CGX) in an experimental rat model. The authors need to be clear that the beneficial effect on liver fibrosis seems to be less striking because 4 weeks is a short time frame to study effects on clinically significant liver fibrosis. While the authors have proven that CGX has beneficial effects on the liver in cases of alcohol-induced liver injury, it is not entirely clear if there is demonstrable anti-fibrotic effect at 4 weeks based on histopathology. We therefore suggest that the authors consider revising the title. The term "anti-hepatofibrotic" probably needs more evidence and a longer-term follow-up than just 4 weeks. In Minor comments: Under Abstract, in "Aim": "...since 2001 in clinical" should be followed by "studies" perhaps.