

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15582

Title: Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease, metabolic factors and hepatocellular carcinoma: An open question

Reviewer's code: 01560058

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-29 22:48

Date reviewed: 2014-12-23 09:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written mini review that addressed hepatocarcinogenesis in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD), in terms of epidemiological and pathophysiological aspects. The Reviewer suggests that the authors add information on molecular genetic and epigenetic mechanisms of hepatocarcinogenesis in NAFLD. For example, variants of the patatin-like phospholipase domain-containing 3 gene, PNPLA3, are well known to be associated with the susceptibility and progression of NAFLD. Recently, the variants of PNPLA3 gene also have been reported to be involved in NAFLD-related hepatocarcinogenesis. Furthermore, recent advances in epigenetics have shed light on the mechanisms of hepatocarcinogenesis in NAFLD. For example, some factors regulating histone acetylation and deacetylation have been reported to be closely linked to hepatocarcinogenesis in NAFLD. Additionally, figures illustrating the mechanisms of NAFLD-related hepatocarcinogenesis may be helpful in understanding this scientific field.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 15582
Title: Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease, metabolic factors and hepatocellular carcinoma: An open question
Reviewer's code: 03023548
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-11-29 22:48
Date reviewed: 2014-12-24 02:07

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT, CONCLUSION. It contains checkboxes for various review criteria like 'Grade A: Excellent', 'Priority publishing', 'PubMed Search', etc.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review by Streba et al. examines the relationship between NAFLD and hepatocellular carcinoma development (HCC). The review goes into great depth to highlight key epidemiological studies that strongly link NAFLD and HCC in human patients. Further the authors discuss possible biological/metabolic pathways (e.g., insulin growth factor, ROS, TNF, adiponectin) and their impact on NAFLD development and progression. In sum, although the review is intriguing and highly relevant there are following concerns: (1) The title of the review "NAFLD, metabolic factors and HCC: An open question" does not fully recapitulate the material presented. The authors go to great lengths to identify the relationship between NAFLD and HCC, however the discussion section of role of metabolic factors in NAFL to HCC progression is feeble—something that should be reorganized and expanded upon. (2) It is well accepted that there are multiple metabolic factors that may contribute to HCC development. The transparency for choosing specific factors discussed in this review should improved. Of note, the factors discussed are only briefly supported by the epidemiological studies presented. A connection between epidemiological and animal studies would make for a significantly



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

stronger argument. (3) Discussion of the homeostatic roles of metabolic factors discussed should be included. (4) The summary section of the epidemiological evidence should lead to a more cohesive and succinct conclusion. (5) A section focused on the interplay of various inflammatory cytokines/immune cells with hepatocytes in context of NAFL to HCC progression should be included. (6) Minor: grammatical and typographic errors should be corrected.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15582

Title: Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease, metabolic factors and hepatocellular carcinoma: An open question

Reviewer's code: 03022633

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-29 22:48

Date reviewed: 2014-12-25 17:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author; *I think category of this manuscript would be letter to editor instead of clinical practice.

*Rules of writing is not appropriate for journal, it must correct. *References must be less than now.It must correct. Sincerely