

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23651

Title: Activated systemic inflammatory response at diagnosis reduces lymph node count in colonic carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 01332768

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-01-09 14:25

Date reviewed: 2016-02-09 23:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Previously, it has been repeatedly reported that the activated systemic immunogenic response, high and low lymph node accounts are significantly related to patient survival. Thus the only possible new information from this study could come from the assessment of the relationship between lymph node account and systemic inflammatory response. The authors need to show that the reduced lymph node account is significantly associated with the activated systemic inflammatory response with a proper statistical assessment.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23651

Title: Activated systemic inflammatory response at diagnosis reduces lymph node count in colonic carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00742509

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-01-09 14:25

Date reviewed: 2016-02-10 07:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript describes findings of statistical-analysis to assess a link between lymph node yields and systemic inflammatory response in patients undergoing for colon carcinoma. Authors suggest an intrinsic link between the host immune-response and patient outcome in colon cancer, and propose that neutrophil-lymphocyte ration can be used to predict nodal yield and provide additional valuable information regarding prognosis. This article is concisely written, and contains interesting findings. Despite of limited number and quality of the data used in this study, the analytical results presented likely support the conclusion made by authors. The information given may be helpful to promote the further advance in the treatment of colon cancer. This reviewer has no essential criticism to the contents.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23651

Title: Activated systemic inflammatory response at diagnosis reduces lymph node count in colonic carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02446423

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-01-09 14:25

Date reviewed: 2016-02-12 22:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Kennelly and co-authors describes a database study of a rather small cohort of colon cancer patients, evaluating whether the number of lymph nodes negatively correlates with the systemic response represented by the Neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio. Although the hypothesis is interesting, the number of patients and the methods used are adequate to establish a statistically/clinically significant conclusion. Minor remarks: The patients should have been selected/corrected for specific TNM stages. CRP data should be included. The legends are too concise. Figure 1 is redundant. Table 4 is confusing.