

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29360

Title: Predictors for advanced fibrosis in morbidly obese non-alcoholic fatty liver patients

Reviewer's code: 02439938

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-10 18:51

Date reviewed: 2016-08-23 10:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the authors: Shira ZS, et al. Predictors for Advanced Fibrosis in Morbidly Obese non-alcoholic Fatty Liver Patients (Manuscript_20160809215512). Shira ZS et al provide a research on Fibrosis in Morbidly Obese determining by FibroScan. This is an interesting paper, but there are several major issues in the manuscript. 1. How many patients with ALT elevation? Does ALT level not influence liver stiffness? 2. Do authors analyze patients with ALT elevation compare with whom ALT in normal range? 3. In this study, there are only 47 patients with ALT level. This is a small sample size. 4. The authors have not analyzed and discussed ALT level impact among groups and fibro stages. The ALT level may have important role in this study. 5. For smoking factor analyzed in fig 3, the $r^2=0.29$, so it is hardly to get the conclusion smoking is a risk factor for advanced disease in this study.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29360

Title: Predictors for advanced fibrosis in morbidly obese non-alcoholic fatty liver patients

Reviewer's code: 00041468

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-10 18:51

Date reviewed: 2016-08-19 16:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study of Shira et al. aimed to examine predictors of liver fibrosis in extremely obese NAFLD patients. Their study is of great clinical importance, well-designed and well-presented. Minor comments that need revision: - reference 23 is not proper, please change it to a proper one. - what can be the explanation of the predictor characteristic of cigarette smoking and liver fibrosis in obese men? After minor revision, I suggest to accept the manuscript for publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29360

Title: Predictors for advanced fibrosis in morbidly obese non-alcoholic fatty liver patients

Reviewer's code: 00507910

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-10 18:51

Date reviewed: 2016-08-21 04:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good job!

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29360

Title: Predictors for advanced fibrosis in morbidly obese non-alcoholic fatty liver patients

Reviewer's code: 00036318

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-10 18:51

Date reviewed: 2016-08-16 17:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting and well-organized study. The results are clearly presented. The authors should address the following minor comments: Please provide the number of patients in whom blood tests were available. Reference 23 refers to patients with hepatitis C. Another study in patients with NAFLD should be used to define cutoffs for fibrosis stages. The authors should mention that cigarette smoking was not an independent predictor of advanced fibrosis in multivariate analysis. Indeed, cigarette smoking correlated with fibrosis in men only, suggesting that the association between smoking and fibrosis is driven by the higher percentage of smoking among men, who are at increased risk for fibrosis. Therefore, the suggestion that smoking cessation might reduce the risk for advanced fibrosis is not supported by the presented data and should be removed. The authors should mention that Fibroscan has limited accuracy in morbidly obese patients.