

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26123

Title: Technical advances in external radiotherapy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00926880

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-02 22:59

Date reviewed: 2016-04-07 16:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review article on the technical advances in radiotherapy for hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). I have the following comments: (1) It is better to add the word 'external' to the title of the paper making the title to look like "Technical Advances in External Radiotherapy for Hepatocellular Carcinoma" because there is the technique of internal radiotherapy for HCC; (2) As stated by the authors, the English needs to improve; (3) Please clearly state in the Introduction this is not a systematic review on the topic; (4) The authors include articles in the review that treated not only HCC, but also other malignant liver tumours with external radiotherapy, e.g. references 6. As the title of the paper clearly stated that this article is on radiotherapy for HCC, this reference should not be included in this paper; (5) If possible please state the evidence level under each of the topics related to the different technical advances in external radiotherapy for HCC; (6) There is no comment on whether the results of external radiotherapy are related to the aetiology of HCC, e.g. hepatitis-B related, hepatitis-C related or alcoholism related HCC.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26123

Title: Technical advances in external radiotherapy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02523682

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-02 22:59

Date reviewed: 2016-05-10 22:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript described various technologic advances of radiotherapy, including 3-dimensional conformal radiotherapy (3D-CRT), intensity-modulated radiotherapy (IMRT), stereotactic ablative body radiotherapy (SABR), charged particle therapy and image-guided radiotherapy (IGRT), and summarized the clinical outcomes. It is very interesting and professional paper for clinical experts in radiotherapy field. But before acceptance, the authors should address the English writing.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>
