

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26791

Title: Immunobiology of hepatocarcinogenesis: Ways to go or almost there?

Reviewer's code: 00503601

Reviewer's country: Singapore

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-04-28 08:44

Date reviewed: 2016-04-28 17:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Fairly detailed and comprehensive review of immunobiology and immunotherapy in HCC. The field is still fairly complex and in its infancy and this review is useful. The writing style is somewhat hard to read and heavy going and may be hard reading for those not so familiar in this area.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26791

Title: Immunobiology of hepatocarcinogenesis: Ways to go or almost there?

Reviewer's code: 02242399

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-04-28 08:44

Date reviewed: 2016-05-08 17:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript summarizes the cancer immunology and oncogenic pathways in HCC. Various immune cells which contribute to establish the tumor microenvironment are listed in this review article. Several oncogenic pathways involved in hepatocarcinogenesis are also under discussed. This manuscript is well described, however, there are still some minor issues need to be further addressed. 1. Pages 6-7, description of the roles of CD8+ T cells in HCC is too little; the authors need to add more references in this part. The correlation between CD8+ T cell, sorafenib sensitivity and PD-1 expression should be addressed in this part. 2. Page 7, the description of CD4+ TH1 cells is not clear. In addition, the two sentences - "TH1 is response for antitumor immune response and they differentiate by response to IL-12 and IFN- γ via signal transduction. The loss of the INF- γ receptor expression on the HCC cell surface may lead to HCC progression and metastasis.", may make the readers confuse. The correlation between 「loss of the INF- γ receptor expression on the HCC cell surface」 and 「TH1 is response for antitumor immune response and they differentiate by response to IFN- γ 」 should be addressed more clear. 3. Page 9, the introduction of TAM/M1 in HCC is too little. 4. Page 13, reference for NK cells should be added in the second paragraph. 5. Page 14, the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

sentence "Add the reference and Num/Denom or %." What does it mean? 6. Another two oncogenic pathways have highly correlation with inflammation and immune response, the STAT3 and NF- κ B pathways, should be included in this review article.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26791

Title: Immunobiology of hepatocarcinogenesis: Ways to go or almost there?

Reviewer's code: 00503441

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-04-28 08:44

Date reviewed: 2016-06-01 03:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript by Patel P et al. elegantly summarizes the current concepts in the immunobiology of hepatocarcinogenesis including the interplay of a variety of immune cells involved in anti-tumor and pro-tumor effects. The Authors highlight the role of the immune system and immunomodulatory therapy against hepatocarcinoma. MINOR 1. The Authors should add some figures to the manuscript. 2. Transforming growth factor-beta pathway should be also discussed.