

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 02860614

Reviewer's country: Pakistan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-10 23:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

As it's mentioned in the article that "In addition, it cannot be excluded that some inmates may have lied regarding certain questions, in particular those concerning IVDU and sexual behavior". Can you suggest something to reduce this from happening in order to improve the future researches.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-13 12:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article written by Zampino et al. summarises the status of HCV infection in the prisoners. The manuscript is well written and gives important information to the readers.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 00012386

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-08 22:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors should ask a native English speaker to check their manuscript before submission. being reported in Central Asia (38%) and Australaria (35%) [3]. These high prevalence are due mostly to unsafe lifestyles

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 00013513

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-21 18:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

HCV infection and prisoners: epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Rosa Zampino, Nicola Coppola, Caterina Sagnelli, Giovanni Di Caprio, Evangelista Sagnelli

Reviewer comments:

In their review, Zampini et al. seek to highlight the precarious situation of prisoners regarding HCV infection, prevention and treatment modalities. They characterize it as social health problem, especially with the limited access to proper management and treatment in this category of patients, and the high rates of transmission (due to the insalubrious life conditions and injection drug use) in absence of preventive strategies established by these penal institutions against the spread of this infection.

The paper pinpoint a problematic concept quite marginalized in the field of infectious disease that is the prophylaxis of main transmitted infections in some special conditions as incarceration institutes, and could be extended to other infections as HIV, HBV or generally, parentally and sexually transmitted infections. However, it is judicious to deal carefully with the idea, because usually, it involves political, strategic, financial and social components and depends on varying parameters from a country to another.

Major issues:

- The authors focused only on publications from Pubmed; this is a limiting method, because the concept, as already said, involves political, strategic, financial and social components. It could better if authors deepen research based on national reports, health bulletin from health ministries, congress and conferences data. It should give more details about the real situation in countries regarding this issue.
- In the paragraph "Different results were reported in two interesting studies comparing the prevalences of anti-HCV-positive cases between prisoners and members of the staff. Tresos et al. [22] performed a multicenter cross-sectional study in Hungary and found a significant difference in the anti-HCV rate between prisoners (4.9%) and the wardens (0.47%), whereas Adjei et al. [31] found the same anti-HCV prevalence (18.7%) in prison officers and prisoners in nine prisons in Ghana, suggesting an occupation-related transmission in this country"

It's a quite distorted idea to say that it suggests an occupation-related transmission in this country, because simply, in Ghana, the prevalence of HCV infection is basically very high (around 15%) in the general population. Indeed, it's ethically not allowed to charge prison staff that they are sharing drug injection tools with prisoners, nor that they have illegal homosexual behavior with them. It is not similar to the occupational transmission in the health care profession. Please, be aware of it.

- The way manuscript is written gives an impression of neglect; please revise the style of your paper.

Minor issues:

- Please number lines and pages in the text

- “A prospective study [24] on 210 anti-HCV-negative subjects observed every 6/12 months for up to 4 years showed an incidence of HCV infection of 14.8 per 100 persons per year”.

This sentence is a bit isolated from the general flow of ideas and come out of the middle of nowhere.

In addition, it could be better if you mention the context of the study (author, year, country...) to understand what it refers to without researching the paper in reference or in Pubmed.

- Several references are missing or false, please check your reference list:

- Babudieri 2005
- Da Rosa 2012
- Karen 2008
- Keirandish 2009
- Mahafoud 2011
- Meyer 2006 or 2007?
- Taylor 2012 or 2013?
- Tresco 2011 or 2012?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 00005208

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-20 17:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The report by Zampino et al. entitled 'HCV infection and prisoners: epidemiology, outcome and treatment' addresses an important clinical as well as social health care problem, i.e., hepatitis C virus (HCV) infection and its transmission and treatment in prisoners. Based on reports published between 1998 and 2013 regarding prisoners world-wide, the authors identified a prevalence of HCV infection (anti-HCV positivity) ranging from 3.1% to 80%, with an overall prevalence of 19% in a population of 4,904 inmates. The major risk factor was intravenous drug use (IVDU) in 53% of prisoners with HCV infection, followed by sex with intravenous drug users, previous imprisonment, coinfection with HIV and/ or hepatitis B virus (HBV), tattoos/ piercing, dental procedures/ surgery and older age. Among anti-HCV positive individuals in different studies 45-90% were HCV RNA positive therefore actively replicating HCV. The management of prisoners with HCV infection has been addressed in only few studies. While the overall response rate to antiviral treatment with pegylated interferon plus ribavirin in prisoners is similar to other patients with chronic HCV infection (about 50%), it appears that prisoners do not receive the same health care as the general population. The paper is well written, clearly structured and informative. It is an important reminder for the health



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

care and prison authorities to create conditions for a better medical care for prisoners with the aim to reduce the transmission of HCV Infection in prisons and to guarantee the appropriate access of prisoners to antiviral treatment and post-treatment follow-up.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 00012216

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-16 16:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Zampino R. et al carry out a comprehensive review about the current knowledge on HCV infection in incarcerated populations. The review is well structured and easy to read, giving information about epidemiology, clinical outcome and treatment. The only possible issue with this review is the novelty, since several papers have been published in the last 5 years on the same topic and this could affect the readers' interest. Moreover they give some advice on how to deal with this issue, but could be interesting to cite the origin of these recommendations and the grade of evidence, otherwise should be only considered as opinions. Here below some of the recent reviews are displayed. The novelty of Zampino's review is based on the role of new DAA in treatment of incarcerated patients. BMC Infect Dis. 2014;14 Suppl 6:S17. doi: 10.1186/1471-2334-14-S6-S17. Epub 2014 Sep 19. Hepatitis C in European prisons: a call for an evidence-informed response. Arain A, Robaey G, St?ver H. Clin Infect Dis. 2013 Aug;57 Suppl 2:S70-4. doi: 10.1093/cid/cit265. Enhancing assessment and treatment of hepatitis C in the custodial setting. Post JJ, Arain A, Lloyd AR. Top Antivir Med. 2013 Feb-Mar;21(1):27-35. Impact of new therapeutics for hepatitis C virus infection in incarcerated populations. Spaulding AS, Kim AY, Harzke AJ, Sullivan JC, Linas BP, Brewer A, Dickert J,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

McGovern BH, Strick LB, Trestman R, Ferguson WJ. Hepatology. 2013 Oct;58(4):1215-24. doi: 10.1002/hep.26387. Epub 2013 Aug 6. Incidence and prevalence of hepatitis C in prisons and other closed settings: results of a systematic review and meta-analysis. Larney S, Kopinski H, Beckwith CG, Zaller ND, Jarlais DD, Hagan H, Rich JD, van den Bergh BJ, Degenhardt L. Expert Rev Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2010 Jun;4(3):355-64. doi: 10.1586/egh.10.26. Chronic hepatitis C in the state prison system: insights into the problems and possible solutions. Imperial JC.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18559

Title: Hepatitis C virus infection and prisoners: Epidemiology, outcome and treatment

Reviewer's code: 02528525

Reviewer's country: Sudan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-06-16 17:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There is no methods in this work. Authors have to insert methods in the abstract as well as in the paper