

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24428

Title: Is there a weekend effect in hip fracture patients presenting to a United Kingdom teaching hospital?

Reviewer's code: 00505420

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-03-01 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-03-01 12:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1 This potential 'weekend effect' may be exaggerated in teaching hospitals.

Am J Orthop (Belle Mead NJ). 2015 Oct;44(10):458-64.

Hip Fracture and the Weekend Effect: Does Weekend Admission Affect Patient Outcomes?

Boylan MR, Rosenbaum J, Adler A, Naziri Q, Paulino CB1.

2 We excluded those whose records were incomplete to avoid unknown confounders.

What data was missing?

3 Between 1st April 2009 and 30th September 2011: Just curious why stop at 2011.....its 2016 now

4 A total of 883 patients were included for the final analysis.

Should be 796 based on your earlier comments

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24428

Title: Is there a weekend effect in hip fracture patients presenting to a United Kingdom teaching hospital?

Reviewer's code: 02446104

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-03-01 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-03-07 14:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors compared mortality and time-to-surgery of patients admitted with hip fracture to their teaching hospital on weekdays vs weekends. As an observational report, it is an interesting study of weekend effect on hip fracture patients. Experiments are generally well conducted and the manuscript is well written. However, the following issues should be addressed. 1. In the Introduction section, the authors should make an effort to address why they investigate the weekend effect on hip fracture patients. 2. I'm not quite sure what kind of physiological or pathological phenomenon cause weekend effect in hip fracture patients. Please explain the physiological meaning of weekend effect in hip fracture patients. 3. In Figs of this manuscript, the error bar is missing and the result of statistical analysis should be marked in each figure.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24428

Title: Is there a weekend effect in hip fracture patients presenting to a United Kingdom teaching hospital?

Reviewer's code: 02713510

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-03-01 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-03-08 18:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting study, with clear methods and results. The only thing that would interest me personally, is whether any difference at all could be seen between weekday and weekends (i.e. are the medians different)? For our Dutch practice, a 24 hour threshold is pursued, so that would be interesting as well. The discussion is clear and addresses strong and weak study points. Perhaps some of the figures could be discarded, as most of the information is already stated in the main text. Regardless of the minor points, I'd recommend publication.