



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15739

Title: High level of intercellular adhesion molecule-1 affects the tumor metastasis and poor prognosis of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer’s code: 02992983

Reviewer’s country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-12-08 10:47

Date reviewed: 2014-12-23 22:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In general, the design is reasonable and the results are worth trusting. Intercellular adhesion molecule-1(ICAM-1) is a important marker in tumor arises, metastasis, and recurrence. In the article, the authors suggested that ICAM-1 may be a promising serological biomarker for HCC diagnosis and an independent predictor of DFS and OS after surgical resection.

1) The paper reported that AUC of ICAM-1 was 0.636 with a 95% CI of 0.571 to 0.698, and a sensitivity of 60.2% and specificity of 77.3%. Why not compared the AUC with the serum AFP?

2) Could ICAM-1 be combined with AFP or other serum markers to enhance the accuracy of HCC diagnosis?

3) "a cutoff value of 684 ng/ml was found to have a relatively high specificity". How to determine the cut-off value? There isn't relevant description in statistical method.?

4) The authors should better revise the manuscript by a naive English speaker. Several grammatical mistake are found, such as "Hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC), ranking the sixth most common malignant tumors worldwide". It was a wrong sentence without predicate. "intra and extrahepatic metastases" should be changed to "intrahepatic and extrahepatic metastases" or "intra- and extra-hepatic metastases". "cut-off" or "cutoff"? The text



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

should be unified. There are lots of such problems about English expression in the manuscript.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15739

Title: High level of intercellular adhesion molecule-1 affects the tumor metastasis and poor prognosis of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02992845

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-12-08 10:47

Date reviewed: 2014-12-24 12:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors investigated the association between ICAM-1 and metastasis and prognosis of hepatocellular carcinoma. By using ELISA and IHC on 236 subjects, they found that high level of ICAM-1 affected the tumor metastasis and poor prognosis of patients with HCC. This is a well-designed study, the writing is good. My only minor comments are as follow: 1, The authors need to add the healthy subjects serum ICAM-1 as controls; 2, There are still many typo-grammar error in the current MS.