

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3698

Title: The Concept of Oxidative Stress and Antioxidant Defense in Crohn' s Disease

Reviewer code: 00029421

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 14:48

Date reviewed: 2013-06-03 18:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author explores the area of ROS biology and its relevance to Crohns disease. I enjoyed this overview and I feel it is strong in the area of the biology of ROS species generation. I have the following comments: The author is encouraged to take on a colleague who works in clinical/translational IBD in order to strengthen the Ms from this perspective. In particular I would like to see more discussion of : 1. The biology of NADPH oxidases - particularly in the GI tract 2. The inherent weaknesses of many of the assays for ROS activity used in earlier studies which are strongly quoted in support of some of the opinions expressed in the Ms. 3. The apparent contradictions raised by the finding of a crohns phenotype in children with Chronic Granulomatous Disease when implicating excess ROS as the cause of Crohns - this is likely to be fundamentally important in light of the evolving concept of immune dysregulation/mucosal immune deficiency in Crohns - some workers are starting to describe gene mutations giving rise to ROS deficiency (rather than excess) in the causation of paediatric IBD. 4. A more nuanced approach to discussions about the possibility that excess ROS damage in Crohns might be a secondary (or even epi-) phenomenon rather than causative. 5. More consideration of ROS as signalling molecules rather than "noxious". 6. While well written there are grammatical issues here and there. I believe that the authors understnading of the word "stricture" is incorrect as it is used inappropriately trthroughout the Ms.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3698

Title: The Concept of Oxidative Stress and Antioxidant Defense in Crohn' s Disease

Reviewer code: 00289456

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 14:48

Date reviewed: 2013-07-11 01:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I suggest to clarify also in the abstract the object of this review article. in the introduction there are two sentences explaining the object of the article, ("...This review is intended to show the role of ROS in development of Crohn's stricture and the new experimental and clinical evidence supporting oxidative stress as a pathophysiological component of CD. ...This review shows in general the concepts of free radicals, lipid peroxide and antioxidant activities and eventually their interferences in the development of Crohn's stricture") it would be better to insert only one of these at the end of the paragraph.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3698

Title: The Concept of Oxidative Stress and Antioxidant Defense in Crohn' s Disease

Reviewer code: 02520845

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 14:48

Date reviewed: 2013-07-16 15:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3698 Title: The Concept of Oxidative Stress and Antioxidant Defense in Crohn's Disease This review highlights the problem of the oxidative stress as an etiological factor of Crohn's disease and display investigations about its role in the pathogenesis of this chronic inflammatory disease. The authors systematically listed and described at first the concepts of free radicals, further concepts of oxidized lipids and the mechanisms of cell damage. Furthermore they described the concepts of antioxidants including the plasma and intracellular antioxidants and they finally described the pathophysiology of oxidative stress in Crohn's disease. The text is accompanied by appropriate scheme of generation of ROS, free-radical chain reaction of lipid peroxidation and Fenton reaction as well as proposed mechanism of production of neutrophil chemokine, IL-8 through the activation of arachidonic pathway. In the reference list, recent researches are listed concerning this topic. In conclusion, this is a very interesting review which provides a view of the problem of oxidative stress in Crohn's disease etiology.