

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 21536

Title: Allograft tissue irradiation and failure rate after anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 03070252

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-23 17:56

Date reviewed: 2015-08-25 11:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Though there is limited data regarding this topic, this was a good review of that data. It was succinct with a clear conclusion. There were only a few minor suggestions, listed below. Line 133 - not aware of association between autograft and arthrofibrosis. If so, should provide reference. Line 130 - Misleading statement, cost is typically lower with autograft even with increase operative time. This statement regarding cost should be removed. Line 358 - There are 'some' advantages, not 'many.'

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 21536

Title: Allograft tissue irradiation and failure rate after anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 03068027

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-23 17:56

Date reviewed: 2015-08-06 19:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Indeed this is a useful systematic review on the use of allograft for ACL reconstruction particularly focusing on the effect of the sterilization process on its biomechanical properties and clinical outcomes. The authors in a simple way introduce the reader to the ACL reconstruction graft options, sterilization process in relation to the results, both clinical and laboratory giving them the opportunity to implement to their practice a better use of grafts for ACL reconstruction To note though: 1. The title focuses on the clinical effect of the sterilization process but in the manuscript and the literature provided findings are related to biomechanical and functional results with failure being only a small parameter for the evaluation of the graft. In my opinion the title could be modified including also the function and biomechanical properties of the allograft. 2. It would be interesting to comment more on the trend towards using allografts for ACL reconstruction 3. Grammatical and language polishing would be required as also given with the yellow marks on the manuscript attached.