Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38855
Title: Emergence of immunotherapy as a novel way to treat hepatocellular carcinoma
Reviewer's code: 00188507
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-28
Date reviewed: 2018-03-29
Review time: 1 Day

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written excellent review focusing on the immunotherapy for HCC.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38855
Title: Emergence of immunotherapy as a novel way to treat hepatocellular carcinoma
Reviewer's code: 02994003
Reviewer's country: Egypt
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-28
Date reviewed: 2018-04-05
Review time: 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

his manuscript is good written and summarized the current status and discussed the future perspective on immune therapy for hepatocellular carcinoma. Manuscript contains good represented and simple figures and recent publications in this research area

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38855
Title: Emergence of immunotherapy as a novel way to treat hepatocellular carcinoma
Reviewer's code: 03664082
Reviewer's country: Reviewer_Country
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-28
Date reviewed: 2018-04-09
Review time: 12 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The number of the words should be less than the current version. This is more likely to be a lecture or chapter book! It is strongly recommended that delete unnecessary and less essential sentences. If below recommendations be considered, and more importantly, the unnecessary sentences and unrelated to immunotherapy of HCC be omitted, it may be qualified for publication in "World Journal of Gastroenterology". Other iportant recommendation: It could be recommended that authors revised the subheads to have a more systematic structure. For example, after the introduction, tumor immunity should be placed. Then start a section with multiple subsections, which cover treatment strategies. The topics should be ordered based on their importance. The recommended subheads are as below 1- Introduction (note: it is also too wordy. It also could be subdivided into different sections, such as introduction, genetics, and risk factors) 2- Tumor immunity; 3- Current and emerging immunotherapy approaches (note:

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

according to the focus of the manuscript on emerging immunotherapy of HCC, "chemotherapy and "Molecular targeted therapy" should be deleted. a. Promotion of anti-tumor immune responses i. Dendritic cell-based therapeutic cancer vaccines ii. Adoptive cell transfer of immune cells (note: cover NK, NTK, CAR-T cells, etc.) iii. Peptide vaccine therapy b. Reversing T-cell dysfunction and exhaustion i. immune checkpoint inhibitors ii. Blockade of immune suppressor cells 4- Future perspectives Other major points: 1- In Table 1, only clinical trials related to targeting PD-1 have been pointed. What about other targets, such as CTLA-4? Take a look at NCT03062358 and search for more phase 3 clinical trials. 2- Also, include clinical trial(s) that target PD-L1. Take a look at NCT03298451 and search for others. Minor points: 1- Keywords need to be revised. Using abbreviations in parenthesis in the keyword section could be omitted. 2- Having a Table to summarize the immunotherapeutic approaches could make the manuscript easier to read.