



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8319

Title: Risk of gastric cancer is associated with PRKAA1 gene polymorphisms in Koreans

Reviewer code: 00070288

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-25 17:26

Date reviewed: 2013-12-26 19:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is about validating the link between genetic polymorphisms of the gene encoding AMPK (PRKAA1) and the risk of gastric cancer. Authors provided enough evidence for proving this point and I believe that the results are worth for publishing.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8319

Title: Risk of gastric cancer is associated with PRKAA1 gene polymorphisms in Koreans

Reviewer code: 00506525

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-25 17:26

Date reviewed: 2013-12-28 11:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work is very good. Congratulations!



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8319

Title: Risk of gastric cancer is associated with PRKAA1 gene polymorphisms in Koreans

Reviewer code: 00068458

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-25 17:26

Date reviewed: 2014-01-04 10:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to authors: In this study, the authors test the association between 5 SNPs of PRKAA1 gene and gastric cancer in a Korean population. The PRKAA1 gene has been implicated in carcinogenesis at several levels and the authors provide a reasonable rationale for this selection. The SNPs show nominally significant association to gastric cancer. Comments 1. Gastric carcinogenesis is a multifactorial and multistage process in which several factors, such as nutritional, infectious and genetic ones, play a role. To consider only the genetic aspect, without analyzing dietary habits, H.pylori infection, gene expression is not exhaustive to conclude that a polymorphic variant is associated with an increased susceptibility to gastric cancer. The authors must collect data about dietary and smoking habits and H. pylori infection in cases and controls. Moreover, the association between PRKAA1 SNPs and gene expression must be analyzed. 2. Regarding the genotyping, the authors should state what quality control measures were made. 3. The authors should include the results of testing the allelic difference between diffuse-type cancer cases vs. intestinal-type cancer cases and EGC vs AGC. 4. Did the authors compare the SNPs frequencies with those generally appearing in other, e.g. Asian or Caucasian populations? 5. In the Discussion section, the authors found that all of the tested SNPs of PRKAA1 we tested were associated with significantly increased risk of gastric cancer. The authors must collect more data to gain insights into a mechanistic hypothesis that could link PRKAA1 SNP to an increased susceptibility to gastric cancer in Korean patients. 6. In addition, it is not still unclear why the authors select 5 SNPs of PRKAA1. Is there any evidences or paper describing that PRKAA1 play a role in gastric carcinogenesis.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8319

Title: Risk of gastric cancer is associated with PRKAA1 gene polymorphisms in Koreans

Reviewer code: 02462675

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-25 17:26

Date reviewed: 2014-01-12 06:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

My Specific Comments:- This is a nice paper with a good summary of the issue and a well described methodology for studying 5 polymorphic alleles of PRKAA1, the gene that encodes AMPK, and gastric cancer in Koreans. I think this is an acceptable paper but I would like to know whether there are any other studies on different population. This information will give the valuable insight of the role of these SNPs in gastric carcinogenesis. As the frequencies of these SNPs may be varied in different population and can lead to racial difference. Also, I would like to know on what basis the authors selected and compared 4 haplotype blocks only? Also, I would recommend the following: 1- Write the full name of PRKPP1 gene in the introduction. 2- State clearly in the results section for each SNP which is the dominant and recessive allele and which genotypes are associated with increase risk of gastric cancer.