

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31265

Title: Predictors of poor outcomes in patients with wild mushroom-induced acute liver injury

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-11-07 16:58

Date reviewed: 2016-11-19 09:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Kim et al. analyzed the possible predictors of poor outcomes in patients with mushroom-induced acute liver injury. They found that all patients with total bilirubin >5 mg/dL or aPTT >50 sec on day 3 died and those could be the good predictors. The data are important because patients with poor predictors of outcomes could be the candidate for liver transplantation. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. Major points 1. It is unclear why only aPTT but not PT is the predictor for poor outcome of the patients. Although the authors discuss on that point, more descriptions including the mechanism for elevated aPTT in those patients are needed. Moreover, the statistical analysis should be re-considered. 2. Only total bilirubin levels are analyzed, but the ratio of indirect bilirubin / direct bilirubin could be another possible predictors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31265

Title: Predictors of poor outcomes in patients with wild mushroom-induced acute liver injury

Reviewer's code: 00011373

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-11-07 16:58

Date reviewed: 2016-11-12 04:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Death rate of the cohort studied of 93 cases of Death rate of the cohort studied of 93 cases of 10.7% is in agreement with findings of studies of similar groups liver transplantation. Authors showed in this study that total bilirubin >5 mg/dL concentration and aPTT >50 sec at day three, correlated with fatal outcomes in patients with wild mushroom induced acute liver injury. These two, could be used as indicators to prescribe liver transplantation. It will be relevant if authors discuss that within the 30 species of most poisonous mushrooms which of them are present in the geographic region of patients