



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 47485

Title: Dietary approach in cirrhotic patients with chronic hepatic encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 02936306

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-17 04:13

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-17 07:21

Review time: 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In my opinion, the manuscript is an excellent and comprehensive review regarding dietary approach for cirrhotic patients with chronic hepatic encephalopathy. I made some proofreading for few spelling and comma error. Thank you!



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 47485

Title: Dietary approach in cirrhotic patients with chronic hepatic encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 03024263

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-17 13:55

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-18 06:26

Review time: 16 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented an excellent review describing the principles of treatment of chronic hepatic encephalopathy in cirrhotic patients. They paid special attention to the dietary approach. Obviously, adequate nutrition is of paramount importance for cirrhotic patients. All of them must pass a nutritional assessment, especially patients



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

with hepatic encephalopathy. I would like to draw the attention to deficiency publications over the past five years (68 - 33,2 %).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 47485

Title: Dietary approach in cirrhotic patients with chronic hepatic encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 02861208

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-19 03:14

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-20 18:45

Review time: 1 Day and 15 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To the authors, This is a well-written and interesting manuscript however, this manuscript DOES NOT focus on nutritional or dietary management, the manuscript is focused, as the authors mention on the gut microbiota and its effect on hepatic encephalopathy. In a small section EASL and ESPEN guidelines for nutritional



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

management are mentioned, but this review does not add any information different from what we already know and has been published in several other reviews (calories, macronutrients, some micronutrients, BCAAs). I do not believe this adds anything different or was missing in the literature to send to a journal such as WJG. Fecal microbiota transplantation is for sure an interesting therapeutic option but has nothing to do with nutritional management and it is included in dietary approach. Although the authors included an exceptional amount of references they left out important and classic references which is also noted in the manuscript as they mentioned several prebiotics and probiotics, and they left out information on VSL#3. My suggestion is to change the title to gut microbiota or something similar instead of dietary approach and maybe try WJH.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 47485

Title: Dietary approach in cirrhotic patients with chronic hepatic encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 00036801

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-17 08:55

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-21 18:02

Review time: 4 Days and 9 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a interesting manuscript reviewing the efficacy of dietary measures to prevent and to treat the hepatic encephalopathy in patients with cirrhosis. The manuscript is well written and the review is extensive including recent advances on the topic. I consider that the content of this review may be useful for the clinician who treats cases of hepatic



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

encephalopathy daily. To improve the readability of the review it would be good to include a figure that summarizes the pathogenesis of hepatic encephalopathy and a table that describes the scientific evidences and clinical utility of different dietary therapeutic strategies.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 47485

Title: Dietary approach in cirrhotic patients with chronic hepatic encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 02567669

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-17 08:20

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-22 10:10

Review time: 5 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is an excellent review about pathogenesis of HE and possible dietary approaches to therapy of HE. For the reader not so familiar with this topic it would be desirable to design some cartoons or tables that better visualize the different aspects of pathogenesis and therapeutic approaches. E.g. NH3-metabolism; Inflammation in HE;



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Leaky gut ... One could easily adhere to the order of the chapters of the manuscript I admit this would require some additional work for the authors, but it would improve the quality and readability of the manuscript.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No