

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39970

Title: Metabolomic alterations and chromosomal instability status in gastric cancer

Reviewer's code: 02687374

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-23

Date reviewed: 2018-05-29

Review time: 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This work investigated to explore the correlation of metabolomics profiles of gastric cancer (GC) with its chromosomally instability (CIN) status. Classification of CIN and non-CIN type was based on 409 oncogenes and suppressor genes sequenced. And the aqueous metabolites were identified by liquid chromatography-mass



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

spectrometry. As a result, authors found that metabolomic profiles of GC tumors and the adjacent healthy tissue are distinct, and the CIN is associated with downstream metabolic alterations in GC. The relationship between metabolic profiles and the occurrence of GC has always been a matter of great concern. This manuscript provides novel evidence for the metabolism profiles and GC. It also provides novel evidence for the relationship between metabolic status and CIN. In the future, the relationship between specific metabolite changes and specific CIN will be further studied. In conclusion, this study provides a basis for the prevention and treatment of GC. In addition, the manuscript was well written. The set of data presented look convincing, solid and support the conclusions drawn. I recommend accepting this manuscript.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39970

Title: Metabolomic alterations and chromosomal instability status in gastric cancer

Reviewer's code: 03317069

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-23

Date reviewed: 2018-05-31

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors explored the correlation of metabolomics profiles of gastric cancer (GC) with its chromosomally instability (CIN) status. This is a carefully done study and the findings are of considerable interest. For the benefit of the reader, however, a number of points need modifying. These are given below. Comments 1. (RESULTS, Patient



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

demographics) How did the authors select these 19 patients? Sample size was too small to explore the correlation of metabolomics profiles of gastric cancer. In addition, the authors should show the statistical analysis in Table 1. There might be difference in age, sex and tumor size. 2. (Discussion) The authors mentioned novel therapeutic possibilities regarding GC from their data. However, this study showed only the correlation of metabolomics profiles of gastric cancer with its chromosomally instability status. It seems to be difficult to connect novel therapeutic possibilities with only these results. Moreover, the authors showed many kinds of Metabolic alterations in GC tumors. In fact, what metabolites can affect cancer progression or patient's prognosis?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39970

Title: Metabolomic alterations and chromosomal instability status in gastric cancer

Reviewer's code: 00343118

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-23

Date reviewed: 2018-06-05

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the study attempts to combine information regarding a new molecular classification of gastric cancer (GC), in particular the CIN GC subtype, and the metabolites produced at the tumor tissue level. However, results are descriptive and the discussion is not sufficiently coherent with the results (While VIT B?? it is not consequent to the metabolite



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

that authors found). Thus the conclusion of the study could be improved to allow sufficient significance and relevance for clinical practice. minor comments: ref 11 is not for laren classification instead for colorectal cancer. the sentence " in addition, thus valid and eay-to use cin....." must be revised. metabolomics offer an alternative to the traditional methods for GC, not solutions at today. Sohn demonstrated that CIN GC had a better OS than GC NOT with non-CIN GC Figure 1 showed not the triangles that instead was indicated in the legend Title of Tables could be revised (NOT healthy but non-CIN tissues, Table 4) ...or incomplte (compared to healthy , table 5)

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No