

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6352

Title: A SPONTANEOUS STRANGULATED TRANSOMENTAL HERNIA: PROSPECTIVE AND RETROSPECTIVE MULTI-DETECTOR CT FINDINGS

Reviewer code: 00289448

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 13:24

Date reviewed: 2013-11-10 17:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present an interesting case of transomental strangulated internal hernia. Case description and discussion is clear and complete. Images are very explicative. References are adequate. I think this paper deserves publication in WJR.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6352

Title: A SPONTANEOUS STRANGULATED TRANSOMENTAL HERNIA: PROSPECTIVE AND RETROSPECTIVE MULTI-DETECTOR CT FINDINGS

Reviewer code: 00214317

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 13:24

Date reviewed: 2013-11-13 17:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is well written but the references are needed to be up to date

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6352

Title: A SPONTANEOUS STRANGULATED TRANSOMENTAL HERNIA: PROSPECTIVE AND RETROSPECTIVE MULTI-DETECTOR CT FINDINGS

Reviewer code: 00289422

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 13:24

Date reviewed: 2013-11-15 17:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Case report "At physical examination a marked abdominal distension could be appreciated with guarding in the left flank without rebound": This sentence is not correct and needs rephrasing for clarification. "An abdominal x-ray plain film (not shown) showed an isolated air-fluid level in the left flank with paucity of gas in the pelvis and in the colonic frame": This sentence is not correct and needs rephrasing for clarification. Discussion "internal hernias can be often mistaken for a small bowel volvulus": this is an important observation and is needed to be further discussed. Differential diagnostic clues should be provided. "To the best of our knowledge, there is only one similar case reported in the literature": this is not correct. There are also other similar cases in the literature. The authors should clarify in which points their case differs from others in the literature and what is really important in this case as an addition to the literature. Figure 1 Change the word "transverse images" to "axial images".

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6352

Title: A SPONTANEOUS STRANGULATED TRANSOMENTAL HERNIA: PROSPECTIVE AND RETROSPECTIVE MULTI-DETECTOR CT FINDINGS

Reviewer code: 00289479

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 13:24

Date reviewed: 2013-11-19 21:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper illustrates a case of spontaneous strangulated transomental hernia investigated with MDCT. The case is rare, very interesting and has an educational value. So, in my opinion, this case is suitable for publication. I have just few considerations for the authors: - Abstract and Introduction are correct - Case report section: plain abdominal film was performed with patient in upright position, or in supine position ? - Case report section: authors do not include any figure related to the plain abdominal film examination. This case should be more interesting if authors will include two figures related to the scout view CT (in A-P and in L-L) - In the Discussion section, authors should underline that preoperative clinical diagnosis is difficult and often results in delayed surgical management, at a stage when intestinal necrosis is present. - References and figures are correct.