



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 77548

**Title:** Clinical efficacy analysis of mesenchymal stem cell therapy in patients with COVID-19: A systematic review

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05246861

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Indonesia

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-05-14

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-05-15 11:14

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-05-18 15:42

**Review time:** 3 Days and 4 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear authors, This is an interesting and valuable article, but need revisions in: 1. Title: see attach file 2. Abstract ok 3. Keywords ok 4. Background OK 5. Methods: see attached file 6. Result 7. Discussion and conclusion, 11. Ref. See attached file. Others OK.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 77548

**Title:** Clinical efficacy analysis of mesenchymal stem cell therapy in patients with COVID-19: A systematic review

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer’s code:** 03947685

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** Saudi Arabia

**Author’s Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-05-14

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-05-21 06:52

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-05-29 16:42

**Review time:** 8 Days and 9 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dr Wang and colleagues have submitted a systematic review entitled “The clinical efficacy analysis of mesenchymal stem cell therapy in patients with COVID-19: a systematic review” for publication. I have the following comments. 1. Were the risk of bias assessed by a standardized risk assessment tool? And if not why? 2. The Cochran’s Q test had the P value of <0.00001, corresponding quantity I<sup>2</sup> was 95%, and a random-effect model was employed. Providing a description of the level of heterogeneity would be better. 3. In the Discussion section on Page#10, the authors state “..... administered in critically ill patient”. Was being critically ill one of the criterion for inclusion in the included studies? And was it an inclusion criterion for this meta-analysis? It does not seem so. 4. On Page 11, the authors write “In our meta-analysis we used random-effect model for the high heterogeneity of the analysis (Fig. 2, 3 and 4), thus we showed no significant change in the inflammatory markers when synthesising evidence, mostly for the high heterogeneity in the included clinical trials.” My question is would the results be different if a fixed-effect model was used? I suggest removing this statement as it indicate the reason for the insignificance of the results was due to the type of model used rather than the actual lack of a difference. When you opted not to use a fixed-effect model due to the high heterogeneity, you showed methodological rigor. 5. According to the authors, their analysis showed no significant decrease in C-reactive protein (CRP) levels, no reduction in D-dimer levels, no decrease in interleukin 6 (IL-6) after the stem cell therapy in COVID-19 but the overall survival (OS) rate improved after the stem cell therapy in COVID-19 patients. I would like the authors to comment on this? 6. Please extensively revise the manuscript for spellings, syntax, and grammar. There is



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

too much redundancy in the text.