

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10859

Title: CT demonstration of the Macklin effect in spontaneous pneumomediastinum: A literature review

Reviewer code: 02346872

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-04-23 22:00

Date reviewed: 2014-04-26 21:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read the manuscript "CT demonstration of the Macklin effect in spontaneous pneumomediastinum: A literature review" WJR 10859 with interest. I consider this paper is acceptable but some editorial or grammatical corrections are required.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10859

Title: CT demonstration of the Macklin effect in spontaneous pneumomediastinum: A literature review

Reviewer code: 02348457

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-04-23 22:00

Date reviewed: 2014-04-27 10:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Authors mainly described spontaneous pneumomediastinum, rather than how to detect machlin effect of SPM using CT. The title should be changed. 2. The order of contents of this review could be rearranged, for example, the main causes of SPM, CT detection of SPM, Complications of SPM. The pediatric SPM can be integrated into the main causes of SPM. 3. Figure 1 and Figure 3 are of poor quality. 4. Figure 3, There is a redundant arrow around the spine.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10859

Title: CT demonstration of the Macklin effect in spontaneous pneumomediastinum: A literature review

Reviewer code: 00289471

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-04-23 22:00

Date reviewed: 2014-05-03 01:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

CT visualization of interstitial emphysema (the Macklin effect) is a well known phenomenon involved in pathogenesis of pneumomediastinum. The article doesn't add any particular information to common knowledge about pneumomediastinum. However it is not a very common finding and may be useful to provide a review of relatively uncommon signs. Anyway the article fails to stress the differences that in clinical practice permit to distinguish among traumatic pneumomediastinum, tracheal or bronchial rupture and barotrauma. There is no mention about the possibility of spreading of air from the mediastinum to the peritoneal space, a finding that can pose some more difficulty in interpretation, especially in emergency setting. In the introduction there is a short list of causes of pneumomediastinum and then "...other etiologies". This looks to me too hasty. It is stated also that air spreads along bronchi and corresponding arteries and veins. Actually bronchi and arteries go together, while veins have a different course. Air should spread along bronchi and arteries and not veins. In the case the authors have evidence of this other pattern of spreading of air they should explicate and demonstrate this fact. Thought that most of pneumothorax are innocuous it is not clear how has been managed the symptomatic patient and what is the correct management of this kind of patients. I don't think barium should be used in the context of a pneumomediastinum of doubtful nature.