BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27666
Title: Impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment
Reviewer's code: 00503241
Reviewer's country: Italy
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-06-15 09:25
Date reviewed: 2016-07-19 21:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It was with interest that I read the Girometti et al's manuscript N° 00200470 "impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment" The authors describe the role of contrast-enhanced ultrasound (CEUS) in patients with renal diseases especially in detection renal infarction, in patients with acute renal failure of suspicious vascular origin, and the capability of characterizing renal lesions. Here few comments: 1- The authors indicate CEUS as valid option to resonance imaging with gadolinium, citing the risk of nephrogenic systemic fibrosis (NSF) related to gadolinium. A brief caution to this point has to be addressed pointing out that NSF was diagnosed only in patients with severe chronic kidney disease stage (stage 5), with the use of old contrast medium used at high dosages. To date there are reported no cases of NSF in patients with normal kidney function. 2- The authors report that using Color Doppler, perfusion abnormalities are often difficult to detect in patients with globally hypoperfused kidneys, and a non-reliable characterization of renal masses is obtained, except for simple cysts: I agree but is CEUS really superior in hypoperfused kidneys? In literature it was not clearly demonstrated, to my aknowledge. 3- The

authors report that "CEUS has the potential to compensate for limitations of conventional Doppler modes with a diagnostic performance comparable or superior to CT in detection of perfusion abnormalities, lesion characterization as cystic or solid": until RCT are not available it is often restricted only in high experienced centers 4- renal biopsy was reported to be done in 6% of patients: however, this diagnostic procedure is not usually executed in the clinical suspicion of renal cystic or solid lesion characterization nor in renal infarction nor in acute renal failure of suspicious vascular origin, but the indication is especially in proteinuric or rapidly progressive renal failure of unknown origin. Among 20/31 patients a final presumptive diagnosis was reached and in three of them a diagnosis of atheroembolic renal disease had positive skin biopsy: however, the diagnosis in such a pathology is often clinical (see reference Scolari F, Ravani P. Atheroembolic renal disease. Lancet. 2010;375(9726):1650-60), sometimes skin biopsy may help in diagnosis, but the role of CEUS in such a microvascular disease involving interlobular and afferent arterioles by cholesterol crystals (as reported by the authors) that are likely too small to be detected with imaging methods may not be considered of first choice, as also noted by the authors. 5- The costs of CEUS are cited by the authors but the question remains if an effective method used by experienced hands, like CEUS, avoids further second level exams, much more expensive, both economically and clinically 6-minor grammatical mistakes 7-indication to CEUS in this scenario is based more on theoretical considerations and expert opinion than on results of validation studies → I agree with this conclusion as addressed by the authors 8-I agree with Girometti et al that CEUS is a safe, simple, and highly repeatable examination method, and it has broad prospects for future development and application. Prospective randomized controlled trials with larger samples will be needed to confirm the high expectations in the future.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27666
Title: Impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment
Reviewer's code: 00736367
Reviewer's country: Italy
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-06-15 09:25
Date reviewed: 2016-06-21 21:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[Y] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study was well conducted but the use of CEUS in Nephrology departments is widespread today, also for trauma, tumors and response to treatments. There is a more recent bibliography than the one presented which shows how said.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27666
Title: Impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment
Reviewer's code: 00503255
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-06-15 09:25
Date reviewed: 2016-06-30 12:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed a retrospective study of 50 patients with AKI suspicious vascular cause and 41 patients with AKI or CKD and renal mass lesions using color Doppler US and CEUS. They reported that CEUS showed high detection rate of renal perfusion abnormalities in patients with AKI, influencing the management of patients with AKI or CKD and renal mass. The paper is well-written and provides valuable information, but some points should be revised. Methods 1. page 6, line 4: "Table 1" did not show patient characteristics, but ultrasound equipment. 2. page 6, line 9: "Table 2" did not show ultrasound equipment, but characteristics of 50 patients with AKI suspicious vascular cause. Results 3. What definition did you use for "ARF" and "CRF" in this paper? ARF is usually the worst grade of AKI staging in KDIGO AKI guideline. CRF is the worst grade of CKD staging in KDIGO CKD guideline.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27666
Title: Impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment
Reviewer's code: 00503175
Reviewer's country: Croatia
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-06-15 09:25
Date reviewed: 2016-07-05 12:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Article "Impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment" by Rossano Girometti et al. is according to my opinion, acceptable for publication. The only needed is minor revision about language. This article is worthwile for publication.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27666
Title: Impact of contrast-enhanced ultrasound in patients with renal function impairment
Reviewer's code: 00227564
Reviewer's country: Egypt
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-06-15 09:25
Date reviewed: 2016-07-10 00:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is discuss important issue about CEUS urologic applications in patient's with impaired renal function.