

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17073

Title: HOW TUBULAR EPITHELIAL CELLS DICTATE THE RATE OF RENAL FIBROGENESIS

Reviewer's code: 00502999

Reviewer's country: Argentina

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-02-11 16:13

Date reviewed: 2015-02-22 22:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article by Louis and Hertig is about the interesting subject of how tubular epithelial cells take an important role in kidney fibrosis. Concerns in general: English language revision is mandatory. Sometimes it is hard for the reader to follow the concepts of the paper. Introduction could be shortened. No mentions to PAI-1 molecule are made in the paper. I believe this molecule must be added into the scene. I recommend the authors to read "Eddy AA, Fogo AB. Plasminogen activator inhibitor-1 in chronic kidney disease: evidence and mechanisms of action. J Am Soc Nephrol 2006; 17: 2999 -3012." Also, when the hypoxic mechanisms and fibrosis are made in relation to diabetes, CTGF is mainly mentioned. As an hypoxic situation that leads to fibrosis, the authors could actually mention Hypoxia-inducible Factor (HIF) and link it to VEGF. I suggest reading the manuscript by "Miyata et al: Diabetic Nephropathy: A disorder of oxygen metabolism? Nat Rev Nephrol 2010; 6: 83-95." Certitem study (in press): If the authors could explain at what time in the patients' history the switching was made to mTORi could be of value, as timing is important. If IFTA was already present at the time of the switching, the mTORi would have been unable to revert the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

situation. A hypothesis that could be added to the paper is the relationship between mTORis and the inhibition of VEGF, that could contribute to fibrosis as well.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17073

Title: HOW TUBULAR EPITHELIAL CELLS DICTATE THE RATE OF RENAL FIBROGENESIS

Reviewer's code: 01704618

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-02-11 16:13

Date reviewed: 2015-02-25 00:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript the author reviewed the literature on conditions reading to renal fibrosis. It is concise review my recommendations are 1. The manuscript should be reduced in size 2. Since the they are all clinical studies supporting the effect of metabolic acidosis on diminished kidney function the authors might want to add or mention in the manuscript. 3. It is crucial that authors include tables to describe the pertinent studies and potential pathophysiologic mechanism involved in renal fibrogenesis.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17073

Title: HOW TUBULAR EPITHELIAL CELLS DICTATE THE RATE OF RENAL FIBROGENESIS

Reviewer's code: 00503228

Reviewer's country: Iraq

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-02-11 16:13

Date reviewed: 2015-02-11 23:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In God's name Good article. I recommend its publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17073

Title: HOW TUBULAR EPITHELIAL CELLS DICTATE THE RATE OF RENAL FIBROGENESIS

Reviewer's code: 00503196

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-02-11 16:13

Date reviewed: 2015-03-05 04:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript NO: 17073 Suggestions to Authors The review with the title: << How tubular epithelial cells dictate the rate of renal fibrogenesis>> is an interesting well written work and the only suggestion is to correct references according to journal's instructions and attention in references 20,40 because the pages are missing.