

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16146

Title: Effect of endogenous cholecystokinin on the course of acute pancreatitis in rats

Reviewer's code: 02439200

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-30 11:20

Date reviewed: 2015-01-16 02:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very good manuscript that addresses a important problem, namely how to best manage patients with acute pancreatitis. There is no specific pharmacotherapy for this disease; thus, management of patients is critically important. The authors demonstrate in a rat model of acute pancreatitis that rest followed by stimulation of CCK secretion is the most effective protocol for recovery from this disease. One minor point: 1 What effect did/would rest and then just feeding on stimulation of the CCK secretion and pancreatic recovery?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16146

Title: Effect of endogenous cholecystokinin on the course of acute pancreatitis in rats

Reviewer's code: 00069230

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-30 11:20

Date reviewed: 2015-01-16 11:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Jia et al investigate the role of pancreatic rest, stimulation and combined rest/stimulation on the evolution of acute pancreatitis in an animal model of acute hemorrhagic pancreatitis. The pancreatic rest condition was induced through loxiglumide, a CCK receptor-antagonist, and the stimulation through camostat, an endogenous CCK release stimulant. To evaluate the effect of the different treatments, the parameters studied involved pancreatic amylase, pancreatic lipase, pancreatic insulin, pancreatic fluid and protein output, pancreatic histological assessment, expression of pancreatic α SMA, TNF- α , IL-1 β . The endocrine performance and as such the β -cell function was monitored through the homeostasis model assessment insulin secretion (HOMA- β -cell) and homeostasis model assessment insulin resistance (HOMA-IR). Although throughout the manuscript the authors refer to the influence of endogenous CCK, the values for this analyte in the groups studied in this work are absent. Instead, they cited in the Discussion section values obtained in a previous publication (Reference 13). However, this previous work did not study the effects induced by the administration of camostat for 10 days. The authors conclude that a favorable approach to treat AP involves inducing pancreatic rest during the early stage of the disease followed by pancreatic stimulation

which would induce the secretion of endogenous CCK. This endogenous CCK would be beneficial as its trophic effect would lead to cellular regeneration. This is a well written and interesting study that addresses a relevant angle in the treatment of acute pancreatitis. Comments to the authors: 1- The present manuscript doesn't show the levels for the endogenous CCK. Endogenous CCK at different time points must be measured in all the groups and results should be included. The minimum time points comprise a) when the treatment is initiated, b) at the end of the fifth treatment day, and c) at the end of the 10 days of treatment and before the rats are sacrificed. 2- Measurement of severity parameters in serum and pancreatic tissue should be included for the same time-points mentioned in point 1. These parameters comprise myeloperoxidase (MPO), TNF- α , IL-6, lactic dehydrogenase (LDH), and C-reactive protein (CRP). 3- The authors conclude that rest followed by stimulation is a better strategy in the treatment of acute pancreatitis than stimulation alone. Although they show a difference amongst these two groups (Bombesin-stimulated pancreatic exocrine response in AP-R/S rats was higher than in AP-S rats), as presented, this difference isn't shown to be significant. For a difference amongst treatments to enable extrapolation of such a conclusion, this difference must qualify as a significant difference. 4- It would be relevant to include in the Discussion section, the results obtained by Song W et al (Song W, Yamaguchi H, Nakano I, Kimura T, Nawata H. Role of endogenous cholecystokinin in the regeneration of pancreatic tissue after acute hemorrhagic pancreatitis in rats. *Fukuoka Igaku Zasshi*. 1996; 87(1): 14-22), which also study the effects of camostat and a CCK-receptor antagonist on pancreatic regeneration after acute hemorrhagic pancreatitis.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16146

Title: Effect of endogenous cholecystokinin on the course of acute pancreatitis in rats

Reviewer's code: 00070291

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-30 11:20

Date reviewed: 2015-01-03 21:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. In the section of Materials and methods: the paragraph of Induction of acute pancreatitis: infusion of 40 ml/100g body weight of 3% taurocholic acid sodium salt.I wonder if it was right for the dose of 40ml/100g? Please confirm it. 2.The running title should be revised

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16146

Title: Effect of endogenous cholecystokinin on the course of acute pancreatitis in rats

Reviewer's code: 02841861

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-30 11:20

Date reviewed: 2015-01-05 21:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1.The running title should be revised. 2.English language and style should be revised, please see the remarks in the manuscript. 3.The methods in the context were not very clearly. 4.Overall, the paper has many problems, needs a major revision.