

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19950

**Title:** Alcoholic hepatitis: The pivotal role of Kupffer cells

**Reviewer's code:** 02444978

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-27 12:20

**Date reviewed:** 2015-06-24 23:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good review on the role of Kupffer cells in the pathogenesis of alcoholic hepatitis that could be improved in the following aspects. The pathogenesis should be better reported. The influence of altered gut microbiota on the liver, could be more extensively explain. In the same way, concomitant metabolic factors should at least be mentioned. The paragraph "Future areas of Researches" is rather confused: it should be written more clearly avoiding repetitions. Abbreviations need to be explained when used for the first time (see ALD in the last page). There are some grammar errors and typos.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19950

**Title:** Alcoholic hepatitis: The pivotal role of Kupffer cells

**Reviewer's code:** 02528178

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-27 12:20

**Date reviewed:** 2015-05-30 02:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a nice review about the role of kupffer cells in the pathogenesis of alcoholic hepatitis. However some points need to correct 1-There are some repetitions in the paper. These repetitions must be excluded 2-This is a review article. For this reason pathogenesis may be defined more comprehensively. And also treatment may be defined more clearly. 3-There are some grammatic errors and typographic errors

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19950

**Title:** Alcoholic hepatitis: The pivotal role of Kupffer cells

**Reviewer's code:** 01439739

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-27 12:20

**Date reviewed:** 2015-06-01 05:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors review the role of Kupffer cells in the pathogenesis of alcoholic hepatitis. This topic has been thoroughly and repeatedly addressed in the past and therefore the ultimate reason to write such review is to provide a comprehensive update with recent advances. This goal is only partially met by this work. To be fair, there has been disappointingly little progress in this field. - The majority of references are correspondingly old, some very old - Alcohol effects on gut microbiota are mentioned only in a cursory manner - There is no mention of the role of recruited macrophages in the process - Little if any is written about how Kupffer cells may play a role if co-morbidities (hepC and NAFLD) are present, which is often the case - Information about how genetic/epigenetic factors may determine individual susceptibility could be mentioned - The results of STOPAH trial (ref 52) could be described with more detail as an important and recent RCT addressing the problem - It is clear that anti-TNF therapy for AH has miserably failed - one would not perhaps discuss this issue under 'Future Areas of Research' - Although it is not obvious to make a connection with Kupffer cells, one could mention the current debate about transplantation in AH in the chapter on therapy - One could also mention leukapheresis as an experimental treatment option (Kamamura Dig Dis Sci 2004;59:482)



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

The grammar needs attention; there are innumerable typos (Kuppfer, mononocytes, chemical destroyed, Thursz paper listed as 2005 in Table 1, etc.) Theodossi (1982) study - which table does this belong to? My print comes out with this entry just prior to Table 1