

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30559

Title: Case of hepatocellular carcinoma in a patient with hereditary tyrosinemia in the post-newborn screening era

Reviewer's code: 00068723

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-12 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-10-12 22:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reported a rare case of HCC in hereditary tyrosinemia type 1 patient. This case suggested a mechanism of hepatocarcinogenesis. This manuscript was informative, but some information was lacking. The patient liver seemed to be liver cirrhosis. Are there any figures of microscopic view of the specimen? Were pathological findings liver cirrhosis? How about inflammation in portal space? If hepatitis existed, there was a possibility that hepatitis-liver cirrhosis was the cause of HCC in HT-1. Were there any blood test variables? They should be presented in Tables.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30559

Title: Case of hepatocellular carcinoma in a patient with hereditary tyrosinemia in the post-newborn screening era

Reviewer's code: 02936735

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-12 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-10-22 09:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Imseis E, et al reported about a case of hepatocellular carcinoma in a patient with hereditary tyrosinemia, a kind of rare lesion, in the post-newborn screening era. This case report is very interesting. However, several concerns were requested for addression. 1. According to the guidelines of AASLD, there is no recommendation for 1.5×1.6cm HCC to perform TACE as an initial and/or bridging therapy for liver transplantation. Thus, author should discuss why this case was treated with TACE before transplantation. 2. Sever language errors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30559

Title: Case of hepatocellular carcinoma in a patient with hereditary tyrosinemia in the post-newborn screening era

Reviewer's code: 03647881

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-12 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-10-25 22:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

No any comment.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30559

Title: Case of hepatocellular carcinoma in a patient with hereditary tyrosinemia in the post-newborn screening era

Reviewer's code: 02938581

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-12 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-10-18 23:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present paper, Imseis E, et al reported about a case of hepatocellular carcinoma in a patient with hereditary tyrosinemia in the post-newborn screening era. The most cases previously reported as hereditary tyrosinemia type 1 were newborn or infant, however, this patient was 7 years old. Furthermore, after liver transplantation, her various symptoms had improved markedly. This case report seems to be very interesting. However, there are some concerns that should be addressed. Major 1. The author should describe the reason why she was treated with transarterial chemoembolization (TACE) before liver transplantation. According to the guidelines of AASLD, EASL and other countries, there is no recommendation for 1.5×1.6cm HCC to perform TACE as an initial and/or bridging therapy for liver transplantation. The author described that she had chronic kidney disease and in clinical practice many clinicians often think that the renal function become worse after TACE. 2. The author should describe about the result of FAH gene study. 3. The author described about the part of explant liver as "several nodules surrounded by smaller irregular nodules containing neoplastic elements" and "The largest nodule had an area of central necrosis with



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

blue staining material with the adjacent blood vessels indicating the site of chemoembolization". Was there no viable HCC lesion? If there was the lesion diagnosed as HCC, the author should describe the pathological diagnosis clearly. 4. Was she treated with living-donor liver transplantation? There was the other case report about the HT-1 patient treated with living donor liver transplantation (Jitraruch S, et al. Long-term outcome of living donor liver transplantation in a Thai boy with hereditary tyrosinemia type I: a case report. J Med Assoc Thai. 2011;94:1276-80).