

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4190

Title: Laparoscopic Versus Open Total Gastrectomy for Gastric Cancer: a meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 00742509

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-20 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-07-01 19:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript describes findings to compare the technical feasibility, effectiveness, and safety of laparoscopic and open total gastrectomy in gastric cancer patients, by investigating short-term and long-term clinical outcomes through a systematic review and meta-analysis of published comparative studies. The authors suggest that laparoscopic total gastrectomy may be safe and effective and offer some advantages over open total gastrectomy in the treatment of gastric cancer. The advantage of laparoscopic total gastrectomy in terms of better short- and long-term outcomes is still controversial. Despite of some of the limitations as authors described in "Discussion", the information given may be helpful to promote the further prospective multicenter RCTs. This reviewer has little critical criticism to the contents.