

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2936

Title: Overexpression of miR-196b and HOXA10 characterize a poor-prognosis gastric cancer subtype

Reviewer code: 00069467

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-28 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-04-20 00:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This manuscript evaluates molecular biologic differences between good- and poor-prognosis patient subgroups, and suggests that overexpression of miR-196b and HOXA10 characterize a poor-prognosis gastric cancer subtype. This paper could be suitable for publication after minor revisions. 1. The title reflects the major topic and contents of this study accurately. 2. The abstract gives a clear delineation of this research, and the significant points conform to the aim, methods, results and conclusion. 3. There are four independent patient cohorts included in the parts of "Patients and samples", but the author did not introduce group 4. 4. The full name of HOXA10 (homeobox A10) should appear at the first time. 5. Overexpression of HOXA10 related to poor OS was described in the manuscript and in Figure 4D, but there were no significant difference between groups ($P = 0.202$). It is necessary to explain the statistic significance for this result. 6. For figure 5A, it is better to change a figure which was more clearly, and please provide a figure of negative expression of HOXA10 to better represent the result. 7. Increased expression of COX2 and cyclin B1 were found in gastric cancer, especially in the C1 groups, it is necessary to confirm the results by other methods. 8. The clinicopathologic factors of patients with gastric cancer participating in the microarray analysis were listed in table 1, it is necessary to analyse the relationship between miR-196b, HOXA10 and the factors. 9. The references are appropriate, relevant, and updated. 10. About the English, please collaborate with a native English speaker to improve language usage.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2936

Title: Overexpression of miR-196b and HOXA10 characterize a poor-prognosis gastric cancer subtype

Reviewer code: 02446363

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-28 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-04-25 07:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

In this study, microRNAs and protein expression profiles were generated by array technologies in 60 patients with gastric cancer and used in identification of two gastric adenocarcinoma subgroups with different prognosis, with a validation by qRT-PCR and immunochemistry in independent patients. The authors obtained the expression data of 1,146 microRNAs and 124 cancer-related proteins and identified four microRNAs that were aberrantly expressed in the two prognostic groups. Among them, miR-196b expression positively correlated with HOXA10 expression which was significantly increased in poor-prognosis patients. To my knowledge, it is the first report concerning the prognostic value of miR-196b in gastric cancer. Therefore, the paper is of originality. However, I think that some issues must be addressed and the manuscript needs a major revision, before decision. Major comments: 1. The current knowledge about HOXA10 in gastric cancer has not been comprehensively summarized by the authors, because a recently published article (Sentani et al. 2012) was not cited. Besides, the divergent results and the reasons of the divergence should be analyzed. 2. The detailed descriptions of staining assessment criteria and the negative control are essential for immunohistochemical staining. 3. Multivariate analysis for prognostic factors of gastric cancer patients should be performed.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2936

Title: Overexpression of miR-196b and HOXA10 characterize a poor-prognosis gastric cancer subtype

Reviewer code: 00112237

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-28 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-04-28 17:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This manuscript tries to identify molecular biologic differences between two gastric adenocarcinoma subgroups presenting different prognosis through analysis of microRNA and protein expression.. The following are my comments and critique: General: Please detailed clinical importance of the development of personalized cancer therapies in discussion section.