

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12278

Title: Why do young people with CKD die early?

Reviewer code: 00503367

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 14:26

Date reviewed: 2014-07-15 07:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting review. Just a couple of suggestions: 1- Under the subheading of cardiorenal syndrome, different aspects of cardiovascular disease in patients with kidney failure has been discussed. This includes increased risk of mortality, coronary events, arrhythmias and sudden cardiac death with worsening kidney function. Even though the bidirectional effect of heart failure and kidney failure is a major concept in cardiorenal syndrome, the text under this subheading does not truly explain cardiorenal syndrome. The text under this subheading would benefit from a modification in a way that describes cardiorenal syndrome more accurately. Increased sudden cardiac death in patients with kidney failure has been addressed later (Pages 12 and 13) and does not need to be mentioned here. 2- The adverse effects of hemodialysis on cardiovascular system has been mentioned. It would be helpful to compare it with those of peritoneal dialysis, which has different hemodynamic and possibly different inflammatory effects.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12278

Title: Why do young people with CKD die early?

Reviewer code: 00503272

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 14:26

Date reviewed: 2014-08-21 21:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

References are not in conformity with the journal's style. It will be nice if the authors can define the abbreviations in Figure 5. These definitions should be part of legend to the Figure.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12278

Title: Why do young people with CKD die early?

Reviewer code: 00503339

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 14:26

Date reviewed: 2014-07-28 22:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In collecting the evidence that microalbuminuria predicts greater mortality in CKD, it might have been noted that the American Diabetes Association advises that the term no longer be used because of the reality that at least one-half of diabetic patients with microalbuminuria either revert to normalalbuminuria or do not progress. Good that the factors that may be influencing survival in CKD are collected and discussed. But, how vague the data are and the need for long term objective studies might have been emphasized.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12278

Title: Why do young people with CKD die early?

Reviewer code: 00462815

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 14:26

Date reviewed: 2014-08-21 17:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article by Kumar et al., titled "Why do young people with CKD die early?" focuses on the causes to which CKD patients die. The topic itself is interesting, although it has been extensively addressed in the literature. A mere compilation of possible causes of death with no critical analysis and no effort to connect them and extract a valuable underlying meaning (such as in this article) is of not much interest. In addition, authors seem to try and find a specific niche, in an otherwise threadbare topic, among young CKD patients. However, this is only a superficial aim, as no specific information is offered on your patients, and even less in comparison to adult or aged patients. Most strikingly, the conclusions do not even mention young patients at all. So, what is the point of addressing death causes among young CKD patients? The authors should reconsider their article in order to profit from the review work done, in order to make it show and offer some relevant analysis.