

ANSWERING REVIEWERS



October 17, 2014

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 14024-revision.doc).

Title: Osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease: A meta-analysis

Author: Chang Seok Bang, In Soo Shin, Sung Wha Lee, Jing Bong Kim, Gwang Ho Baik, Ki Tae Suk, Jai Hoon Yoon, Yeon Soo Kim, Dong Joon Kim

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 14024

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated.

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer.

First of all, we appreciate the Editor's and reviewers' thoughtful and helpful comments. Also, we are pleased to have an opportunity to make this paper to be an even better one and to be accepted with revision, because the Editor and reviewers provided additional important points that we have not realized before.

(1) Reviewer 69814.

We appreciate the reviewer's thoughtful comments. The detailed corrections are listed below.

1. "Interesting review with minor language mistakes"

->Typographical errors and language mistakes were corrected. Page 4 (line 4), Page 10 (line 28), Page 16 (line 2), Page 19 (line 3), Page 19 (line 8).

(2) Reviewer 2314

We appreciate the reviewer's thoughtful and helpful comments. The detailed corrections are listed below.

1. "The authors include "non-randomized" studies, but it is unclear whether they refer only to observational studies or also include trials. This should be specified wherever appropriate. Among observational studies, it is necessary to distinguish case-control and cohort studies."

-> The study format was specified in the manuscript according to the recommendation of reviewer; "The study format of each study was as follows; cohort study (10)^[21-26, 39, 40, 42, 45] and case-control study (5)^[41, 43, 44, 46, 47]." (page 9, line 23-24)

2. "The great heterogeneity of studies raises concern on the validity/generalizability of results.

This should be addressed more clearly in the discussion. All confounding factors limit the clinical impact of the study. Any role of concomitant drug exposure?"

-> Authors totally agree with reviewer's opinion. The substantial heterogeneity is the limitation of this study and this content is illustrated in manuscript (page 14, line 23). The heterogeneity of current evidence is the phenomenon and authors cannot handle or manipulate this. Therefore, authors tried to find the reasons of heterogeneity and this content is illustrated in discussion section. Unfortunately, there was no information about role of concomitant drug exposure in all of the enrolled studies.

3. "The aim "to evaluate the current evidence regarding osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease" is too generic and should better reflect the results of the study, which is a systematic review with qualitative and quantitative evaluation through meta-analysis techniques."

-> The sentence was corrected as "To evaluate the association between alcoholic liver disease (ALD) and bone fractures or osteoporosis" (page 3, line 2-3 / page 5, line 16-17) according to the reviewer's recommendation.

(3) Reviewer 70897

Authors appreciate reviewer's thoughtful and valuable comments. The detailed corrections are listed below.

1. "No strong evidence supported their conclusions due to lack of high-quality studies and much heterogeneity among studies as the authors mentioned, although the authors did their best to minimize those publications bias."

-> Authors totally agree with reviewer's comment. The substantial heterogeneity is the limitation of this study and the methodological quality of enrolled studies are not so high. However, the result of this study is the phenomenon about landscape of this study field. Heterogeneity and low-quality is the current situation about this topic. Authors wanted to know the current evidence level about this topic and tried to find the reasons of heterogeneity for the future study perspectives. Recognizing this situation and compensating weak points of current studies proven by this meta-analysis could be helpful for the future studies.

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*.

Sincerely yours

Chang Seok Bang, M.D.
Dept. of Internal Medicine
Hallym University College of Medicine
Chuncheon Sacred Heart Hospital
153, Gyo-dong, Chuncheon, Gangwon-do
200-704, South Korea

Gwang Ho Baik, M.D.
Dept. of Internal Medicine
Hallym University College of Medicine
Chuncheon Sacred Heart Hospital
153, Gyo-dong, Chuncheon, Gangwon-do I
200-704, South Korea



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

Tel.: +82-33-240-5000

Fax: +82-33-241-8064

E-mail: cloudslove@naver.com

Tel.: +82-33-240-5647

Fax: +82-33-241-8064

E-mail: djkim@hallym.ac.kr



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China
