



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14024

**Title:** Osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 00069814

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-15 21:20

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-01 14:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

interesting review with minor language mistakes



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14024

**Title:** Osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 00002314

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-15 21:20

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-30 01:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study addresses an interesting topic and merit. However, it has some intrinsic methodological limitations which decrease its potential clinical impact. In my opinion, the following issues should be addressed. 1) The authors include "non-randomized" studies, but it is unclear whether they refer only to observational studies or also include trials. This should be specified wherever appropriate. Among observational studies, it is necessary to distinguish case-control and cohort studies. 2) The great heterogeneity of studies raises concern on the validity/generalizability of results. This should be addressed more clearly in the discussion. All confounding factors limit the clinical impact of the study. Any role of concomitant drug exposure? 3) The aim "to evaluate the current evidence regarding osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease" is too generic and should better reflect the results of the study, which is a systematic review with qualitative and quantitative evaluation through meta-analysis techniques.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14024

**Title:** Osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 00070897

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-15 21:20

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-18 17:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed meta-analysis to evaluate the current evidence regarding osteoporosis and bone fractures in alcoholic liver disease. This is very attractive topic. However, no strong evidence supported their conclusions due to lack of high-quality studies and much heterogeneity among studies as the authors mentioned, although the authors did their best to minimize those publications bias.