

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28237

Title: PNPLA3 Polymorphism Increases Risk and Severity of Chronic Hepatitis C Liver Disease

Reviewer's code: 00006518

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-06-28 11:10

Date reviewed: 2016-07-09 00:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Please modify the sentence in the AIM of Abstract, "...with the whole liver disease spectrum." (target: CHC patients?) 2. The first appeared medical term need its full name, such as "hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC)" 3. No uppercase letters for keywords (please follow WJG's guideline) 4. Please define "steatohepatitis" and "advanced fibrosis", and clarify if steatohepatitis had been studied in any selected articles 5. Please clarify the reason for citing reference 15 in Quality Assessment, i.e. the association between "antibiotics and development of inflammatory bowel disease (reference 15)" and "discrepancies between three coauthors (the sentence in this manuscript)" 6. In the last paragraph of DISCUSSION, please clarify the sentence "..., beginning with fatty liver disease, cirrhosis, and HCC in patients with CHC." (beginning with...and end up with HCV-related death event?) 7. Should "steatohepatitis" take into account in the disease spectrum of PNPLA3 polymorphism like "advanced fibrosis" being mentioned in the Core tip behind the Abstract?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28237

Title: PNPLA3 Polymorphism Increases Risk and Severity of Chronic Hepatitis C Liver Disease

Reviewer's code: 03647931

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-06-28 11:10

Date reviewed: 2016-07-12 02:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed a systematic review of 380 articles and selected 19 articles to examine the association PNPLA 3 polymorphism and severity of chronic hepatitis C disease. The manuscript is well designed and clearly written, however, I have few comments: The introduction section is too short for a meta-analysis paper with a systematic review of a large number of articles. 1- I would like the authors to add more information about PNPLA3 polymorphism across different ethnic groups (what is the frequency of GG genotype in different races?). The articles included in this meta-analysis studied only 4 ethnic groups (Asians, Caucasians, North Africans and mixed) 2- In table 1, the ethnicity was not shown in some studies. 3- what are the components of the mixed group? 4- Is there any data on Sub-Saharan Africans, African Americans or Hispanics?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28237

Title: PNPLA3 Polymorphism Increases Risk and Severity of Chronic Hepatitis C Liver Disease

Reviewer's code: 03648382

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-06-28 11:10

Date reviewed: 2016-07-13 02:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

PNPLA3 Polymorphism is changeable according to ethnicity. There has been no evaluation in this respect.