

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23890

Title: UNDERNUTRITION, RISK OF MALNUTRITION AND OBESITY IN GASTROENTEROLOGICAL PATIENTS: A MULTICENTER STUDY

Reviewer's code: 02528832

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-12-24 08:41

Date reviewed: 2016-01-03 05:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have excluded cirrhotics because of the obscuring effect of ascitis and or edema. Inflammatory diseases may cause a drop in serum albumin levels that decrease oncotic pressure and favors fluid leakage to the interstitial space, that may reach up to 5 l before edema is clinically evident. This problem should be commented in the discussion, because it leads to an erroneous assessment of BMI. It would be useful for the reader if the authors show in tables how the MNA, MUST and NRS scores are obtained. English should be carefully revised.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23890

Title: UNDERNUTRITION, RISK OF MALNUTRITION AND OBESITY IN GASTROENTEROLOGICAL PATIENTS: A MULTICENTER STUDY

Reviewer's code: 03475944

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-12-24 08:41

Date reviewed: 2016-01-06 10:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors should write the key words in the abstract , and justify the sample size according the precision, safety and losses in material and methods section. In the results section, it would be useful to know the prevalence of patients malnourished/at risk of malnutrition according the method used to assess the nutritional state and the age group (≥ 65 / <65 years) . Also knowing the prevalence of patients according the pathologies studied in each group of disease (acute, chronics and tumors). The english should be reviewed

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23890

Title: UNDERNUTRITION, RISK OF MALNUTRITION AND OBESITY IN GASTROENTEROLOGICAL PATIENTS: A MULTICENTER STUDY

Reviewer's code: 03490662

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-12-24 08:41

Date reviewed: 2016-01-06 23:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The major points are as follows: 1. The consideration of patients a chronic, acute and neoplastic diseased, need to be well classified, as because if the patients are considered neoplastic in addition having any other chronic or acute disease or any other secondary complications which may affect the nutritional status of the patients may give an erroneous data. 2. How obese patients are considered to be undernourished and being and being as risk of malnutrition? Explain. 3. The physiological basis of undernutrition, malnutrition and obesity and their consequences need to be clearly explained. How they may be interrelated? 4. "Risk of malnutrition increased progressively and significantly in chronic, acute and neoplastic gastrointestinal diseases in inpatients and elderly population." What is new in this statement? 5. What do you actually mean "Undernutrition was defined as unintentional weight loss..."? How to categorize "unintentional"? To me this is not well accountable. 6. What could be the status of a similar patient who is underfed previously, so in a protein energy/calorie malnutrition? 7. Why prevalence of undernutrition, malnutrition and risk of malnutrition all are higher in inpatients? Why obesity is higher in outpatients? Need to be well defined. 8. Different nutritional status in



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

relation to several physiological Vs pathological conditions are not discussed properly in the MS 9. There are several grammatical errors and disordered sentences in the MS. 10. The result section has a messiness, results should be under sub headings 11. The MS need major revision to proceed further.